WHY ARE WOMEN COMPARED TO CHICKEN CAGES?: WOMEN’S IMAGE IN THE SHORT STORY “KETIKA SAATNYA”

Ramis Rauf, Indra Purnawan Panjaitan, Dhini Yustia Widhyah Saputri, Rasiah, Afriani Ulya, La Ode Gusman Nasiru, Lucia Arter Lintang Gritantin

ABSTRACT

Objective: This research aims to reveal Bugis women's social and cultural aspects as subordinate individuals in literature, especially Darmawati Majid's short story “Ketika Saatnya”. The study is confronted with a conundrum regarding the portrayal of women from developing countries in Darmawati's Ketika Saatnya. The problem in this research is “how is the women portraying in the short story "Ketika Saatnya"?

Methods: This research uses qualitative research by categorizing it based on specific characteristics and components relevant to the research objectives, with the ultimate goal of obtaining research findings. This work utilizes Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak’s philosophy of the subaltern. The term “subaltern” denotes a subordinate social, political, and geographical population under the power of a dominant group. A subaltern refers to a group member whose voice is consistently represented and used as a tool for hegemonic activities. It implies the dominance of one group over another in terms of politics, the military, society, and even culture.

Conclusion: The research reveals that women, positioned as subalterns, are depicted as a marginalized group striving to express their opinions and gain recognition despite being categorized as “third-world women” trapped between traditional and modern values.

Keywords: Spivakian, women, subaltern, postcolonial literary, Indonesian short story.
"POR QUE AS MULHERES SÃO COMPARADAS A GAIOLAS DE FRANGO?": IMAGEM FEMININA NO CONTO "KETIKA SAATNYA"

RESUMO

Objetivo: Esta pesquisa tem como objetivo revelar os aspectos sociais e culturais das mulheres bugis como indivíduos subordinados na literatura, especialmente o conto de Darmawati Majid "Ketika Saatnya". O estudo é enfrentado com um enigma no que diz respeito à representação das mulheres de países em desenvolvimento na série de Darmawati Ketika Sanatnya. O problema nesta pesquisa é “como as mulheres estão retratando no conto "Ketika Saatnya"?

Métodos: Esta pesquisa utiliza pesquisa qualitativa, classificando-a com base em características específicas e componentes relevantes para os objetivos de pesquisa, com o objetivo final de obter os resultados da pesquisa. Este trabalho utiliza a filosofia do subalterno de Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. O termo "subalterno" denota uma população social, política e geográfica subordinada sob o poder de um grupo dominante. Um subalterno refere-se a um membro do grupo cuja voz é consistentemente representada e usada como uma ferramenta para atividades hegemônicas. Implica o domínio de um grupo sobre outro em termos de política, militar, sociedade e até mesmo cultura.

Conclusão: A pesquisa revela que as mulheres, posicionadas como subalternas, são retratadas como um grupo marginalizado que se esforça para expressar suas opiniões e ganhar reconhecimento, apesar de serem categorizadas como "mulheres do terceiro mundo" presas entre os valores tradicionais e modernos.

Palavras-chave: Spivakian, mulheres, subalterno, pós-colonial literário, indonésio conto.

«¿POR QUÉ SE COMPARA A LAS MUJERES CON LAS JAULAS DE POLLOS?»:
IMAGEN DE LA MUJER EN EL CUENTO “KETIKA SATANYA”

RESUMEN

Objetivo: Esta investigación tiene como objetivo revelar los aspectos sociales y culturales de las mujeres bugis como individuos subordinados en la literatura, especialmente el cuento “Ketika Satnya” de Darmawati Majid. El estudio se enfrenta a un dilema en relación a la representación de las mujeres de los países en desarrollo en Ketika Satnya de Darmawati. El problema en esta investigación es “¿cómo están las mujeres retratando en el cuento “Ketika Satnya”?

Métodos: Esta investigación utiliza la investigación cualitativa al categorizarla en función de características y componentes específicos relevantes para los objetivos de investigación, con el objetivo final de obtener los resultados de la investigación. Este trabajo utiliza la filosofía de Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak de lo subalterno. El término "subalterno" denota una población social, política y geográfica subordinada bajo el poder de un grupo dominante. Un subalterno se refiere a un miembro del grupo cuya voz se representa y utiliza consistentemente como una herramienta para actividades hegemónicas. Implica el dominio de un grupo sobre otro en términos de política, el ejército, la sociedad e incluso la cultura.

Conclusión: La investigación revela que las mujeres, posicionadas como subalternas, son representadas como un grupo marginado que se esfuerza por expresar sus opiniones y obtener reconocimiento a pesar de ser categorizadas como “mujeres del tercer mundo” atrapadas entre los valores tradicionales y modernos.

Palabras clave: Spivakian, mujeres, subalterno, literario postcolonial, cuento indonésio.
1 INTRODUCTION

Throughout history, women have consistently been portrayed and categorized as women from the Third World and subaltern groups in literary works (Barry 2022; Grabe 2020; Hasanah and Andari 2020; Middleton and Hamalian 1985; Mursalina 2015; Udasmoro 2022; Udasmoro and Setiadi 2021; Udasmoro and Saktiningrum 2022; Udasmoro and Rahmawati 2023; Rigual, Udasmoro, and Onyesoh 2022; Elly Prihasti Wuriyani, Wening Udasmoro 2017; Fatmawaty, Udasmoro, and Noviani 2022). In terminological terms, the “subaltern” denotes junior British military officers considered subordinates. The term is frequently employed to denote officers who are subordinate or rank below captains. In critical theory and postcolonialism, the term “subaltern” pertains to a group of individuals who exist outside the dominant power structure of the colonial nation regarding their social, political, and geographical positioning. In his analysis of cultural hegemony, Antonio Gramsci (Morton, 2008; Rauf et al., 2020; Rauf & Amalia Masri, 2019) introduced the word "subaltern" to refer to groups excluded and marginalized within the social hierarchy.

Spivak argues that the term subaltern should not be limited to referring only to the oppressed class or the “Other” group, as it carries more nuanced meanings beyond these negative connotations. According to Spivak, in the context of postcolonialism, the term "subaltern" refers not just to those who are oppressed or belong to the working class but also to individuals whose ability to express themselves is restricted due to their limited access to representation. In the context of the Sati tragedy, Spivak's use of the term "subaltern" initially referred to widows who experienced oppression within the hierarchical power dynamics present in Indian society. Widowing is one of several subjects. The essay “Can the Subaltern Speak?” explicitly asserts that in “A Literary Representation of the Subaltern (1988),” the author utilizes subaltern material from Mahasweta Devi Stanayasadini's story to critically analyze several “elite” Western theoretical discourses and expose their deficiencies and disregard for the subaltern perspective. Spivak's focus lies on the examination of secondary characters, subplots, and motifs that may appear insignificant but serve to expose the underlying racial biases present in a range of female-authored canonical writings from the nineteenth century. One prevalent feature is the utilization of the “re-constellation” or “catachresis” technique (Moore-Gilbert 1997).
Catachresis is a strategic manoeuvre that involves extracting specific images, ideas, or rhetorical methods from their original context and utilizing them to create new layers of significance, frequently contradicting accepted interpretations and purposes. It significantly transformed Gramsci’s notion of the “subaltern”. Within the text “Can the Subaltern Speak?” In her analysis, she adopts a specific interpretation of “Otherness” as defined by Derrida, elucidates its meaning within the eschatological concept of the “Other”, and reimagines it to critique alternative (post) colonial ideas of metropolitan identity (Moore-Gilbert 1997).

Women from developing countries, portrayed as marginalized individuals in fiction, particularly in literary works, depict significant socio-cultural circumstances about gender and discourse in the present time. The author’s portrayal of third-world women in a literary work intends to communicate a message about socio-cultural circumstances, highlighting the ongoing development process for the reader to comprehend. The researcher examines the historical record of women from developing countries as depicted in the anthology of short stories titled “Ketika Saatnya”, authored by Darmawati Majid.

Darmawati Majid hails from South Sulawesi and is recognized as an Indonesian novelist. In her numerous works of fiction and nonfiction, she consistently articulates her views on gender, locality, education, and family matters. This disruption arose from Darmawati's upbringing in the strict Bugis society, characterized by a strong emphasis on masculinity. Under this circumstance, women, including Darma, were prohibited from making inquiries or filing lawsuits. She witnessed the cyclical transformation of Bugis women, starting with circumcision, transitioning into girlhood, marrying through matchmakers, experiencing pregnancy, giving birth vaginally, becoming mothers, and fulfilling their roles as wives. In addition, Darmawati prioritized marrying someone from the same ethnic background to prevent family conflicts and maintain social harmony. Darmawati's consciousness materialized tangibly. This interaction expanded her understanding of how Bugis women, for instance, did not require higher education to alleviate the concerns of families worried that their children would become too independent and marginalized by males. The first anthology by Darmawati, Nasu Likku and Other Stories came out in 2017. The stories in this compilation also revolve around women, tradition, education, and family. Ketika Saatnya is identical. This book's primary
focus revolves around how women prioritize and assign value to the most significant aspects of their lives.

Darmawati was designated an Emerging Writer at the 2018 Ubud Writers and Readers Festival (UWRF) in Bali. Her compilation of short stories, titled “Ketika Saatnya and Other Stories”, was assessed at the Makassar International Writers Festival in 2019, with Emil Amir fulfilling the moderator role. Darmawati has been invited to the Banggai Literary Festival in 2022, where she will deliver a narrative centred around her book and actively engage in a writing workshop. Darmawati received an invitation from UWRF to participate in Australia's 2018 Digital Writers Festival. Darmawati's additional work, Legacy, was selected for inclusion in Harvest Moon: Poems and Stories from the Edge of the Climate Crisis, a joint project between Agam Agenda and the Institute for Climate and Sustainability. The “Cities” anthology was awarded the National Book Award for Best Anthology during the 40th National Book Awards ceremony held on April 28, 2023, in Manila, Philippines. The source can be found at the website http://www.cnnphilippines.com/life/culture/literature/2023/4/28/40th-national-book-awards-winners.html.

The anthology of short stories, Ketika Saatnya, contains a range of narratives corresponding to the author's claim of engaging in self-criticism over their Bugis heritage. The books Ketika Saatnya, Perempuan yang terkunci Pintu Jodohnya, Kiriman dari Inggris, and Uang Panaik compile narratives that delve into the emotional distress experienced by women about enduring love, societal class disparities, financial anxieties, and domestic abuse. The short story Ketika Saatnya is the only one that explicitly portrays a context of misogyny, where a female character exhibits hostility towards other feminine female figures. Darmawati's representation of rivalry among women in a confrontational manner serves to highlight the detrimental effects of toxic masculinism, as it diverts women's attention away from their collective struggle and instead encourages them to engage in internal conflicts. The portrayal of Tante Sitti, who remains passive and unable to take action upon seeing her husband's infidelity, epitomizes the concept of a submissive woman. She was compelled to go into madness immediately after her spouse entered a new marriage. Upon regaining her wits, she immediately harassed Alaida for marrying a man of her own choice instead of someone from her family. The plot skillfully portrays the influence of misogyny.
“Perempuan yang terkunci Pintu Jodohnya” and “Kiriman dari Inggris” discuss the roles and limitations of women within the Bugis community. An exemplary Bugis woman enters into matrimony upon reaching the appropriate age for marriage. They must promptly abandon any aspirations and desires they perceive as conflicting with their shared determination. Otherwise, they will be considered sinners. Unlike Ketika Saatnya, there is less indication of psychological strain or overt conflict among women in this narrative, much like in Uang Panai. The plot is intricately connected to the dispute between Alaida and her father regarding dowries and presents. This narrative affirms the values and guidelines followed by Bugis women, which include refraining from eating before men, refraining from clearing the dishes while men are still eating, eating only after men have finished, and maintaining loyalty regardless of the husband's conduct. However, compared to Ketika Saatnya, this tale concludes with the timeless conflict between males and females.

Several scholars have conducted extensive research on women in developing countries. One individual is Saputra, as documented in 2011. In 2011, a Faculty of Languages and Arts graduate at the State University of Jakarta authored a scholarly journal titled “Subaltern Women in Postcolonial Indonesian Literature”. He asserts that the women’s roles of Nyai Ontosoroh, Surati, Prinses van Kasiruta, Pulette (Buru Tetralogy), Nyai Dasima (Njai Dasima) and Srintil (Ronggeng et al.) have been marginalized and relegated to subordinate positions, occupying the lowest social status. Women need to assert themselves and demonstrate their presence. Despite their awareness of an impending defeat, even the women refrained from attempting to resist. Spivak's assertion, which expressed reservations about subaltern groups, has been validated and is now regarded as an unresolved issue, as it has been addressed and resolved. Subaltern groups will lack agency in expressing their perspectives and making autonomous life decisions. They will remain permanently quiet. Pramoedya Ananta Toer, G. Francis, and Ahmad Tohari have depicted women as subjects in their books.

Ten years later, in 2021, M. The user’s name is Hafidzullah S.M. Et al., a literature postgraduate student at Gadjah Mada University's Faculty of Cultural Sciences, who analyzed the portrayal of Third World women as postcolonial constructs in Chris Cleave’s novel “Little Bee”. This research suggests a contradictory finding where the author portrays women from two distinct worlds at opposite ends of a spectrum. The West is often regarded as possessing a distinct character, while the East may be deemed superior.
The portrayal of women through material objects reflects a revival of the depiction of women from Eastern cultures. The author's subjective portrayal as a narrator shapes the perception of constructing and depicting women. The novel portrays Little Bee and his fellow refugees, as well as Sarah's character, in a way that suggests a contrasting relationship between race, ethnicity and shared memory. Within this collection of short stories, the author explores the theme of women's inability to articulate their thoughts and opinions, whether due to societal conventions or the forces of progress. The researcher rephrases the various issues as the following question: “In what manner are third-world women depicted in the short story Ketika Saatnya?” The problem’s significance lies in its potential to serve as a platform for educating the millennial generation about the utilization of regional literature as a means of fostering diverse identity and cultivating the Indonesian nation's culture. The short narrative “Ketika Saatnya” aims to enable students to observe the socio-cultural phenomenon of achieving gender equality by balancing the roles of women and men within the social hierarchy.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

Consistently, Spivak focuses on the implementation and principles of teaching, a subject that warrants further examination in the works of Said and Bhabha. Spivak aimed to integrate non-Western cultural works into Western academic institutions while still addressing the limitations of the dominant canon and study methods. However, this approach unintentionally continued to marginalize literature from the so-called "third world" and maintain its subordinate status. Spivak delineates many methods he refers to as "transnational cultural studies" that might be promoted, specifically focusing on the graduate level. She proposes various measures, such as ceasing single-author research, broadening the language prerequisites to encompass non-Western languages, and addressing more substantial issues. Postcolonial studies benefit from the more effective integration of critical theory through nonliterary media and popular forms of culture. Spivak refutes the notion that a pure and untainted realm exists beyond the realms of analysis and objects. Postcolonial criticism can gain entry through personal life experiences or cultural background (Moore-Gilbert 1997).

Spivak faces three criticisms. Spivak argues that Deleuze’s use of the “labour struggle” as a central concept in his political theory and practice is flawed due to an unsupported Eurocentric perspective. According to Spivak, Deleuze overlooks the global
division of labour, a common characteristic of poststructuralist political theory. Secondly, Spivak contends that Foucault and Deleuze prioritize micro-resistance structures characterized by localized conflicts and voluntary associations while disregarding macro-level logical and “objective” determinants such as class interests, global capitalism, and nation-state alliances. Nevertheless, she ought to have given greater consideration to the efficacy of the micrologic resistance pattern. Spivak contends that removing greater power configurations and other possible sites and resistance types should not be permitted. Furthermore, Spivak presented the notion of ideology as a means to critique Foucault and Deleuze’s understanding of the subject, which she said oversimplified the role of desire (Moore-Gilbert 1997).

This perspective presents subjectivity, agency, and identity clearly and understandably, ironically similar to the principles advocated by liberal humanism. It reintroduces unified individuals into discussions about power, emphasizing the importance of personal volition. Spivak's theory of the subject combines elements from the classical Marxist model of the "split and dislocated subject" and Althusser's concept of subjects being held together through ideological interpellation while only appearing to have free subjectivity. Spivak argues that it is preferable to maintain the subaltern as an enigmatic and unapproachable entity. According to Moore-Gilbert (1997), it uncovers the limits and frontiers of Western knowledge.

Spivak perceives deconstruction as possessing a more immediate and assertive “affirmative” style. Spivak argues that deconstruction enhances the recognition of social groups who have been excluded or disadvantaged. There is a correlation between suppressing or disregarding certain information to allow a specific theory or text to function as a consistent and authoritative narrative and how the dominant social group exercises its hegemonic power. Spivak used deconstruction to undermine the binary system, which serves as the foundation for legitimizing the power of the dominant discourse (namely Western hegemony). According to Spivak, counter-hegemonic discourses that directly challenge the ruling party are more likely to be suppressed or co-opted, similar to Derrida's perspective. Instead, Spivak suggests that “tangential” or “wild” guerilla engagement modes are less susceptible to cancellation. Therefore, Spivak argues for “negotiation” and “criticism” modes that disrupt the dominant party's power and influence (Moore-Gilbert 1997).
According to Spivak, counter-hegemonic discourse involves reinterpreting the dominant ideology in two specific areas: defining identity and investigating the function of the subject. According to Spivak, Derrida's notion of the deserving individual is crucial in avoiding the emergence of fundamentalist politics in postcolonial struggles. It is achieved through Derrida’s criticism of conventional interpretations of “identity, belonging, and origin”. According to Spivak, the self or subject should be perceived as being shaped through discourse rather than inherent or predetermined, making it unavoidably “worthy”. The subject’s effects can be succinctly represented as follows: what seems to function as a subject may be a constituent of a vast, non-continuous network (in a broad sense) of interconnected elements, which can be referred to as politics, ideology, economics, history, sexuality, and language. The varied knots and configurations of the strands are defined by diverse determinations, which rely on different circumstances that generate the effect of the subject of operation (Ray 2009).

Spivak also utilizes Lacanian theory to explain how the subject exists due to its emergence through the symbolic order expressed in language. Spivak references Foucault to highlight the several unavoidable subject positions that shape the textual nature of writers, readers, and the subject. Textuality refers to a state in which the boundaries of the self-become blurred, and elements of the other are present, hindering the complete presence of identity and consciousness. Spivak refutes any notions of identity based on the essentialist understanding of origin or possession. Spivak’s theory of identity, based on the “spread” and “textual” model, rejects the notion that only postcolonial subjects can address the subject of postcoloniality. Spivak refers to this position as “nativism” or “reverse ethnocentrism”. Spivak acknowledges that the dominant cities frequently treat postcolonial issues in a generalized manner (Moore-Gilbert 1997).

Spivak’s analysis of affirmative deconstruction focuses on the role and politics of the “subject of investigation”. In her work “Subaltern Studies: Deconstructing Historiography”, Spivak argues that there is a mistaken assumption among the group that they can disregard the consequences of creating a platform for the oppressed to voice their experiences. This problem is also highlighted in her essay “Three Women’s Texts and a Critique of Imperialism”. Spivak illustrates this argument by comparing the ideas of Foucault and Deleuze with an analysis of how the British claimed the authority to represent disadvantaged indigenous women in the discussion about banning Sati in early 19th-century India. A crucial strategy, exemplified by Rani of Sirmur, involved creating
a portrayal of Indian women that supported the acceptance of the empire’s “modernizing, liberating, and progressive” rule. It also reinforced the British imperial self-perception as superior to indigenous women, who were seen as debased by their local oppressors. In the essay “Three Women’s Texts and a Critique of Imperialism”, Spivak highlights that St. John Rivers, a missionary in Jane Eyre, rationalizes her missionary endeavour as a means to enhance her race and achieve the “emancipation” of India. These sentiments have persisted into the present century, especially among individuals who oppose colonial control (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

The fundamental aspect of the appropriation process in the discussion of Sati is the concept of “voice”, which refers to marginalized women's volition and independent action. Regarding Britain, it is claimed that the voice is summoning the imperialists to seek liberation. As per the local man, the voice aligns with his actions. As per the analysis presented in “Can the Subaltern Speak?”, no specific version or perspective can accurately portray the authentic voice of the marginalized female. Spivak highlights that the British struggle to correctly spell the names of the individuals they claim to have rescued and frequently convert proper names into generic nouns.

In contrast, Spivak notes that the harm Sati causes to Indian society is closely related to the widow's level of wealth, indicating that less fortunate women frequently escape the hardships that their more affluent counterparts experience. In both discussions of sati, the marginalized voice employs ventriloquism, expressing itself through verbal means. Spivak argues that there is a lack of female voices expressing their consciousness. This absence of women's representation is a result of both colonialism and indigenous patriarchy. Women are not completely erased but rather subjected to a cycle of violence that serves as a metaphor for the struggles faced by third-world women caught between traditional values and modernization.

3 METHODS

The approach in this analysis is a qualitative research methodology. This study aims to provide a verbal or written description of the data, categorizing it based on specific characteristics and components relevant to the research objectives, with the ultimate goal of obtaining research findings. The research relies on the short story “Ketika Saatnya”, authored by Darmawati Majid, as the primary data source. The research data comprised both primary and secondary data. This research's main data for analysis are the
texts in the short tale anthology “Ketika Saatnya”. Secondary data, such as books, journals, written works, and articles, contribute to examining third-world women, specifically Bugis women.

Data collection involves the process of actively reading the text of short story (Sudaryanto 1988; Ramis Rauf et al. 2023). The data collection process for this research involved the following steps: 1) thoroughly and repeatedly reading the text of the short story “Ketika Saatnya”; 2) selecting data based on language identification (literary text); 3) recording relevant data for research analysis; 4) analyzing the data using the theory or paradigm of the Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak subaltern; 5) compiling research reports. During the data analysis phase, a descriptive and explanatory approach is employed to elucidate the portrayal of women from developing countries as depicted in the short story “Ketika Saatnya”.

4 RESULT

4.1 WOMEN AS SUBALTERNS: THIRD-WORLD WOMEN

The concept of third-world or Eastern women embodies a manifestation of colonization that is conveyed through socio-cultural, economic, political, and other dimensions (Mohanty et al., 1991). Faruk (2007) argues in the book “Belenggu Pascakolonial: Hegemoni dan Resistance Dalam Sastra Indonesia” that postcolonial theories examine the enduring effects of colonialism on colonized nations, which have evolved into a new form of neocolonialism.

The existence of third-world women (Mohanty 2007) is considered excessive in terms of domestic issues. Hence, the image of third-world women becomes a homogenization agenda for first-world women (Western women) to create an ideal image for female subjects. Homogenization is an act of hegemony that forms a particular identity created on the collective memory of Eastern subjects (the colonized people). The form of homogenization of women can be found in the short story anthology "Ketika Saatnya” by Darmawati Majid. The short story anthology “Ketika Saatnya” is a collection of short stories about the image of third-world women in various districts and cities in South Sulawesi. The problems presented by the author in the short story anthology are said to be various, ranging from women who are cheated on by their husbands and the position of women in marriage to women who are locked in their mate. The third-world female
figures revealed in this study are Alaida, Ammak, and Indah. By following the short story “Ketika Saatnya” shows the dialogue between Alaida and Ammak.

What is the reason for comparing women to laying eggs, Ammak? Alaida expressed intense anger. How subordinate is the status of women in their cultural practices? (Majid 2019).

The quote above depicts Alaida, a female character in a patriarchal Bugis-Bone society, who confirms the subordinate role of women to her mother, Ammak. The author portrays women in the Bugis-Bone tribe as “ampoti”, which refers to chicken cages. In this society, women are expected to save money, manage family finances, and accompany their husbands. Ammak serves as an example of this representation, highlighting the distinctive position that Bugis-Bone women occupy. It serves as a reminder to academic feminists, both from the Third World and the First World, that despite extensive research on the concept of "woman," one aspect that has been overlooked is the need to refrain from considering oneself as special solely based on gender. Spivak argues that we should not use culturalism to escape ethnocentrism but rather explore the psychological and societal factors that shape women's experiences differently. Regulatory psychobiography is a narrative framework that provides significance to interpretations of oneself and others. The uterine social organization cannot be eliminated as it involves the suppression of ideological material related to the clitoris, which serves as a marker of gendered subjects who exert specific oppression against women. The Bugis-Bone community uses this system, also known as the “chicken cage”, to exert strong control and extract surplus value within the Bugis-Bone cultural order (Ray 2009).

The author used the chicken cage emblem to assert the portrayal of Bugis-Bone women's identity in South Sulawesi. Signifiers or emblems representing the subject's identity can also be observed in several literary compositions, ranging from local and Indonesian to English and American literature. In the spoof novel “The Wind Do Not Go” (abbreviated as TWDG), which is a parody of “Gone with the Wind”, the author uses the symbolism of cinnamon and coffee to depict the physical characteristics of black people as being dark and dense, akin to the colour of chocolate. Cinnamon is a spice characterized by its thick texture and strong taste. The sign for bitter coffee is equivalent to this. However, it imparts a heightened experience to the individual who ingests it. These presuppositions are understood as a tangible portrayal of black individuals even
though black is not visually appealing but possesses great liveliness. Vitality is being strong and healthy, which is crucial for the human body (Rasiah 2020).

In early modern Europe, spices were regarded as valuable commodities that signified the social status of those who possessed them. Europeans were eager to travel to the Eastern Hemisphere to acquire spices, such as Maluku. Records about using spices for medicinal purposes were discovered during the fifth century AD. Black pepper, often known as black pepper, treats several severe illnesses, such as paralysis, dysentery, oral and throat irritation, and bubonic plague (Rasiah 2020; Andaya 2015). Spices were utilized in religious ceremonies, particularly in Ancient Greece, for embalming bodies and as sacrifices to multiple deities (Turner). Spices symbolize the identity of black individuals and signify the contributions made by black people in America. These ideals enhance not only the makeup of the population but also the cultural diversity that contributes to the strength and variety of the American nation. This diversity enhances America's distinctiveness and sets it apart from other countries.

It is the fate of a wife to show respect to her husband, my child. The husband diligently fulfils his responsibilities, providing for the needs of his wife and children. Therefore, when you are married in the future, you should wholeheartedly obey and fulfil your husband's command without any reservations. Through this method, we, as women, receive divine blessings (Majid 2019).

The inherent purpose of a wife is to demonstrate reverence towards her spouse, who is of the female gender. The spouse diligently fulfils his obligations to support his wife's children. Hence, when you enter into matrimony in the future, you must comply with your husband's directives without any trace of reluctance or half-heartedness. Thus, women receive divine favour (Majid 2019).

The comment confirms the enduring influence of patriarchal ideology within the Bugis-Bone group in South Sulawesi. The patriarchal tradition has effectively suppressed Alaida's persona. She felt compelled to acquiesce because the individual engaging in the conversation was her biological mother. She observed and confirmed that her mother embodies a historical figure who continues to uphold the principles of patriarchy by remaining faithful to her spouse (Alaida’s father). Here, the author examines the topic of women exhibiting misogyny against other women.

Women experience historical oppression, specifically misogyny, perpetrated by both men and women and resistance against it is challenging. Women are subjected to victimization and are believed to have been divinely ordained as the recipients of masculine dominance. Consequently, the internal thoughts and emotions of a woman in
distress will perpetually go unnoticed, even among her female peers. The suppression of Alaida's voice by Ammak can be seen as a manifestation of the subaltern, a social concept prevalent in indigenous cultures that relegates women to subordinate roles, where their existence is limited to addressing domestic concerns such as wells, mattresses, and kitchens (Gandhi 2006). It signifies that women are regarded as subordinate in family dynamics. Women in a patriarchal society are excluded from participating in the public realm. Women's role is solely supplementary, and their actions or interactions with males are only utilized to the extent that they bolster men's endeavours and undertakings. Women will be esteemed if they possess worth and contribute to the well-being of males. Consequently, the status of women becomes peripheral.

Tjerita Njai Dasima (1896) by G. Francis is another instance of a narrative that depicts the experiences of underprivileged women. Francis is a European author. The narrative of Nyai Dasima revolves around a Javanese woman named Nyai Dasima who assumes the role of a nyai for a British gentleman named Tuan W. Nyai Dasima is shown as a stunning and benevolent woman. The image had Mr. W spellbound. As a nyai, Nyai Dasima is capable of experiencing both happiness and luxury. Nevertheless, all those efforts were undermined by an indigenous individual named Samioen. Samioen had influenced Nyai Dasima by suggesting that the name’s position was seen unfavorably and that Tuan W, as a colonial figure, could only exploit the wealth of the indigenous people. Samioen, with his strategic prowess, has deceived Nyai Dasima into departing from Mr. W and entering into matrimony with him. Women are sometimes stereotypically portrayed as weak and lacking power, being treated as objects. Women can be regarded as subordinate and are denied the opportunity to assert, advocate, or exercise autonomy in determining their lifestyle. Francis (1896) depicted a nyai who could not match colonial authority’s dominance, as Pramoedya Ananta Toer expressed through his character Nyai Ontosoroh. Nyai Dasima’s vulnerability and lack of assertiveness make her susceptible to rapid marginalization by patriarchal authority.

Pramoedya presents Nyai Ontosoroh as a sequel to Nyai Dasima to advocate for her rights as a woman and enhance the status of women as nyai. G. Francis, who has struggled to maintain her sense of self-respect as a nyai, is the narrator of “Nyai Dasima”. She emerged from the colonial region to vindicate her reputation as the paramour of a colonial gentleman despite being regarded as a wife and enjoying a lavish existence in a palace. Nyai Dasima has become influenced by conversations suggesting that her role as
a nyai is perceived unfavourably and may have detrimental consequences for her future, as Tuan W, a colonial gentleman, intends to go for his homeland and abandon Nyai Dasima. Nyai Dasima's newfound ability to express herself allowed her to separate from Mr. W and marry Samioen even though she would be his second wife. Nyai Dasima’s resistance was primarily confined to a cultural clash between the colonial powers and the indigenous population. She opted to wed Samioen because she believed their marriage was lawful and socially acceptable. During her tenure as Nyai Tuan W, there needed to be more clarity, rendering it in violation of Islamic law or the customs of indigenous communities. The story’s conclusion justifies the inferior and second-class position of women. The women’s voices had been suppressed prior to their expression and contemplation. Society has granted the patriarchal system legal recognition, allowing it to establish a narrative where males are positioned as rulers and women are subordinate to them. Women's literary works have frequently depicted instances that support Spivak's claim that the subaltern group is unable to articulate their thoughts and experiences.

According to Spivak (de Kock 1992), literary works have the potential to serve as significant markers for studying postcolonial society and issues about colonialism, such as the challenges faced by marginalized populations. Throughout the colonial era, numerous incidents occurred that became significant historical artefacts, serving as tangible reminders of the unsightly aspects of colonialism. Women, as a subordinate group, sought emancipation as a means to liberate themselves from both the colonial and patriarchal systems, which were used as a colonial tactic to subordinate women. Women faced discrimination both during and after the colonial era as a means of reinforcing the dominance of the patriarchal culture. The lack of women's liberation can be attributed to the efforts of the patriarchal or colonial system to suppress it and restrict women's access to opportunities and spaces. Women’s existence is still regarded as subordinate and submissive, leading men to employ patriarchal and colonial authority to suppress them.

The merchant consistently requests the return of the bottle upon purchasing bottled tea. Men also do. Regardless of the scattered contents, the crucial aspect is that the bottle returns to its original location. While spouses need to fulfil their responsibilities at home, provide for us both physically and mentally, and remain present, it is not acceptable for them to engage in infidelity. Mrs Rania provided a clear and concise explanation (Majid 2019).

Unlike the character Alaida, a woman from the Bugis-Bone tribe in a developing country, the author portrays Indah as an educated urban woman. Nevertheless, the author
portrays Indah's character as a subaltern woman who cannot express her emotions in response to the patriarchal discourse upheld by her neighbours. Indah is thus depicted as a female subject. The notion that men engaging in infidelity is inherent provided that the guy is capable of fulfilling all the various requirements of his wife and children, both on an emotional and practical level. Spivak refers to this discourse as essentialism. Spivak recognizes that essentialism poses an inherent risk to the subaltern in terms of perception. Essentialism aims to restore the voices of marginalized individuals by promoting diversity and presenting a simplified portrayal of the different identities within specific social groups. Essentialism can be regarded as the aspiration and desire of a subordinate group. Essentialism is a tactic that a select number of marginalized individuals will utilize to their advantage.

Essentialism pertains to the collective identity within inter-community discussions that enables marginalized voices to gain attention, be heard, and be comprehended. Essentialism emphasizes the significance of diversity (subaltern, not as "the Other") inside social collectives. However, in its actual application, strategic essentialism is merely a political tool that exploits marginalized individuals. Women are consistently the exclusive targets of social or sexual exploitation. Women are a tangible representation of the "other" in society. In this scenario, the concept of the concrete other might be seen as acknowledging the 'other' as a person with a specific past, distinct personality, and genuine emotional makeup. Women possess the entitlement to not only articulate their viewpoints but also engage in cognitive processes. Throughout generations, women have associated compassion with a symbol deeply ingrained in their thoughts (Supelli 2006).

According to Spivak (Ray 2009), transactional reading views the collective as a strategic means of adhering to the essentialist concept of consciousness to portray subalterns as historical subjects. The concept of essentialism represents the second primary issue following the subaltern as a fundamental type of hegemony. Strategic essentialism is a method of communication that signifies one's standpoint in participating in feminism that opposes essentialism. Women’s pursuit of individualism often comes at the cost of disregarding the needs and interests of other women. Strategic essentialism, following reduction, entails a philosophical acknowledgement of the anti-essentialist assertion that, fundamentally, there is no inherent identity.
Strategic essentialism maintains that identity remains constant for particular political motives. As an illustration, one could briefly acknowledge the classification of “women” as a consistent entity to rally women for political engagement (J. Barker 2017; C. Barker 2004). They assert that strategic essentialism is connected to creating a historical narrative and emerges while expressing one's subject stance. The above excerpt of the short story depicts men as the driving force behind the economy, disregarding the challenges faced by women, undermining their credibility, and assuming equal roles as both parents and children. Women are essential agents for the perpetuation of life, serving as entities that engage in reproduction and regeneration. The primary protagonists in the conflict are the males.

You opt to exhibit patience as you await the return of your bottle. It is not a matter of life or death at this point. It is well-recognized among educated individuals that maintaining a healthy spirit is essential (Majid 2019).

The author portrays Indah, an educated lady living in the city, as a representative of subaltern women who have their voices marginalized. The term “subaltern” does not solely refer to the oppressed class or the “Other” group, but it is also a sophisticated term. From a postcolonial perspective, the phrase encompasses all aspects of access limitations. It transforms into a realm of differentiation. During a demonstration, a leader of the demonstrators actively advocated for labour rights in opposition to the approval of the Job Creation Act. Workers who lack freedom of speech and are consistently excluded from having their voices heard are considered subalterns. Spivak highlights the importance of recognizing and understanding the hidden dominant process using subaltern word characteristics. The workers are engaged in a hegemonic discourse, which refers to subtle and unconscious manipulation of their actions (Morton 2008).

5 DISCUSSION

Spivak raised doubts about the academic community’s association with Liyan, although indirectly. In order for Spivak to demonstrate a genuine involvement with the subaltern, scholars must distance themselves as authorities within the dichotomous social dynamics of “Us” and “Them”, “Center” and “Periphery”, and other binary divisions. Western scholars possess a strong interest, particularly in the subaltern experience of colonialism. Nevertheless, they were averse to being caught amid the colonial subjugation. There exists a significant divide between the academic world and the
subaltern. It reveals the truth from experts or academics, known as the subaltern truth. Subaltern individuals only provide information on colonialism for academic utilization, particularly by Western scholars.

Hooks (1990) stated, “... I do not need to perceive your auditory stimuli. It is preferable to discuss oneself rather than simply being able to articulate about oneself. I do not require auditory communication from you. I require your suffering. I require your narrative to reiterate it to you in a novel manner. I reiterate it to you in order to appropriate it as my own. By rewriting, I am creating a new version of myself. I remain the author and possess the ultimate authority. I am the subject who continues to be the colonizer. You are the focal point of my conversation”. An instance of Foucauldian epistemic violence refers to the erasure of non-Western societies’ perspectives in understanding the world. The subaltern is subjected to oppression and manipulation, which leads them to adopt a perspective that aligns with that of the Western nation when it comes to perceiving the world. If the entire society adopts a singular perspective, specifically the Western perspective, we must acknowledge colonialism in its most discursive manifestation.

According to Spivak, epistemic violence is particularly relevant to Third World women who are consistently denied the opportunity to articulate their thoughts and experiences. They serve solely as a catalyst for evoking sympathy to draw a comparison with women considered necessary, such as Western women who possess qualities like elegance, freedom, and independence. It refers to how colonial powers exerted dominance over non-Western civilizations, shaping their perception of the world to align with the understanding and knowledge of Western society (Sharp). In addition, Spivak strongly emphasizes the importance of avoiding perceiving subaltern individuals as cultural outsiders. He posits that the Western world might advance and flourish expeditiously by engaging in self-evaluation and introspection of core concepts and investigative approaches (reasoning), prompting them to explore the culture of less advanced non-Western societies. Western nations attain cultural superiority by establishing cultural benchmarks.

In French feminist theory, particularly in Kristeva, subaltern women are conceptualized as a unified repository of their distinctiveness. Thus, according to French feminists, these additions serve as a transient representation of inherent worth, consistently positioned on the opposing side. According to Spivak, when the subaltern woman is reconfigured inside the “micrology of political economy”, she is essentially
reduced to a mirror that only reflects the perspectives imposed upon her. French feminism aims to develop a dialogue about women that challenges the understanding of women's significance for women. French feminism is primarily concerned with examining the connection between femininity and women in various forms of communication, such as discourse, literature, and philosophy, with women themselves.

Subaltern women occupy an intermediate position between the intersections of globality and development, as well as immigration and multiculturalism. Gender globalization fosters the formation of gender alliances. The organization justifies its ethical goals by invoking a simplistic concept of global justice that overlooks the complex issues of economic and cultural disparities on the other side of the economic spectrum. It is possible to expose the disparities between these two discourses that women are present in and to comprehend the women's movement in colonial discussions and the recurring apathy throughout decolonization. Upon the occurrence of such a divide, it becomes apparent that the term “woman” possesses diverse connotations in various settings: on the one hand, it refers to a female individual found in the urban areas of the capital, while on the other hand, it pertains to a female residing in a rural abode, with the possibility of her eventual return. It is only possible to address one aspect by considering its counterpart. It is not feasible to focus solely on a certain aspect of feminism, as gender serves as a focal point for discussions regarding progress and the fight for women's equality on a global scale.

6 CONCLUSIONS

This research yields two interdependent conclusions. Firstly, the author's portrayal of third-world women in the short story anthology “Ketika Saatnya” depicts them as uniformly lacking power and occupying a victimized position within social, cultural, and economic systems, as well as patriarchal discourse. The colonized subject consistently reinforces these discourses. Secondly, the author's colonialization efforts serve to represent third-world women as subordinate subjects. Ultimately, third-world women are consistently positioned as objects by the author.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would express their gratitude and appreciate to the Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (the Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education) under the Finance Ministry of the Indonesia Republic for facilitating this research through the fund incentive of international journal as one of the items in scholarship’s letter of guarantee. The authors also extend their appreciation to Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat (LPPM) Universitas Khairun who have made the right decision to choose us as one of the PKUPT’s recipients.
REFERENCES


