READINESS LEVEL OF BUREAUCRATIC APPARATUS AND ITS IMPACT ON ONLINE-BASED COMMUNITY SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM SERVICES; EVIDENCE FROM TEBING TINGGI CITY, INDONESIA

Manda Yulian, Sirojuzilam, Suwardi Lubis, Agus Purwoko

ABSTRACT

Background: The online-based social-economic development program has emerged as a prevalent bureaucratic service model in Indonesia, particularly at the municipal government level. The model has not been consistent across all service units despite the implementation in several agencies providing bureaucratic service. Therefore, this research aims to analyze the factors affecting the readiness of the community and apparatus in the implementation of the online-based government bureaucracy service model.

Method: The research with focus of research on the online-based government bureaucratic service system. This research uses descriptive and explanatory methods with a quantitative approach. Descriptive research is a study to describe in detail a particular phenomenon.

Results: The results show that understanding, technology mastery, mental and moral guidance, formal and informal education, as well as material and non-material incentives have a positive and significant impact on the readiness of the community and apparatus in providing online-based bureaucracy service. Furthermore, online-based social-economic development program services can accelerate the role of the community and apparatus in developing urban areas.

Conclusion: Tebing Tinggi City government and other similar city governments should focus and increase their attention to efforts to increase mastery of technology and moral development in the bureaucratic service apparatus, as well as build a performance-based equitable material incentive system. Improving the three aspects of apparatus readiness will encourage the realization of better community socio-economic development program services.

Keywords: bureaucratic apparatus, online-based bureaucratic services, socio-economic development, Tebing Tinggi city.

---

a Master in Regional Planning Doctoral Program Student, Postgraduate School, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia, E-mail: mandayulian2021@gmail.com, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0007-7146-7686
b Ph.D in department of economic development, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia, E-mail: sirojuzilam@usu.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0005-1425-1534
c Ph.D in department of Communication Studies, Faculty of Social Science and Political Science, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia, E-mail: suwardi@usu.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5517-4177
d PhD in department of Forestry, Faculty of Forestry, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia, E-mail: agus9@usu.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2237-245X
NÍVEL DE PRONTIDÃO DO APARELHO BUROCRÁTICO E SEU IMPACTO NOS SERVIÇOS DO PROGRAMA COMUNITÁRIO DE DESENVOLVIMENTO SOCIOECONÔMICO ON-LINE; EVIDÊNCIAS DE TEBING TINGGI CITY, INDONÉSIA

RESUMO

Histórico: O programa de desenvolvimento socioeconômico online emergiu como um modelo predominante de serviço burocrático na Indonésia, particularmente em nível de governo municipal. O modelo não tem sido consistente em todas as unidades de serviço, apesar da implementação em várias agências que prestam serviços burocráticos. Portanto, esta pesquisa tem como objetivo analisar os fatores que afetam a prontidão da comunidade e do aparelho na implementação do modelo de serviço de burocracia governamental on-line.

Método: A pesquisa com foco de pesquisa no sistema de serviços burocráticos governamentais on-line. Esta pesquisa utiliza métodos descritivos e explicativos com uma abordagem quantitativa. Pesquisa descritiva é um estudo para descrever em detalhes um fenômeno específico.

Resultados: Os resultados mostram que a compreensão, o domínio da tecnologia, a orientação mental e moral, a educação formal e informal, bem como os incentivos materiais e não materiais, têm um impacto positivo e significativo na prontidão da comunidade e do aparelho para fornecer serviços de burocracia on-line. Além disso, os serviços de programas de desenvolvimento socioeconômico em linha podem acelerar o papel da comunidade e do aparelho nas zonas urbanas em desenvolvimento.

Conclusão: O governo da cidade de Tebing Tinggi e outros governos municipais semelhantes devem focar e aumentar sua atenção nos esforços para aumentar o domínio da tecnologia e desenvolvimento moral no aparelho de serviço burocrático, bem como construir um sistema de incentivo material equitativo baseado no desempenho. Melhorar os três aspectos da prontidão dos aparelhos encorajará a realização de melhores serviços do programa de desenvolvimento socioeconômico comunitário.

Palavras-chave: aparelho burocrático, serviços burocráticos online, desenvolvimento socioeconômico, cidade de Tebing Tinggi.

1 INTRODUCTION

Based on the government system, the City Government holds important service functions that are in direct contact with the community (Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government). Therefore, the role of the city, sub-district, and village governments is very large in bureaucratic services and urban community development. Currently, the issue of government bureaucratic services is still a major issue at the national, regional, and local levels, including in the kelurahan. There are still many internal and external obstacles in the government that are the cause of the above problems. On the
other hand, the concept of development from the periphery which is currently being developed by the government also means that the process of accelerating development must be initiated from the smallest level.

One model of bureaucratic service at the city government level that is currently being developed is an online-based bureaucratic service that has been carried out in Tebing Tinggi City. This service model is quite interesting and has been applied in various agencies that have a bureaucratic service function. However, so far the implementation has not been going well in all existing Regional Apparatus Organization (RAO) or online-based bureaucratic service units. The extent to which the readiness of aspects related to the apparatus as the main actor of online-based bureaucratic services is also one of the important things that is not yet known.

Online-based bureaucratic services are targeted to be a stimulant for the acceleration of development in Tebing Tinggi City as one of the urban areas in North Sumatra Province, and are expected to become a model for urban area development in North Sumatra. Appropriate policies based on the results of scientific studies are needed as an important policy brief in encouraging the acceleration of urban area development. Therefore, this study aims to examine the extent of the readiness of the apparatus in various aspects which include understanding/insight, mastery of technology, mental development, moral development of the apparatus, formal education, informal education, and material incentives in the application of online-based government bureaucratic services in Tebing Tinggi City.

2 MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research was conducted in Tebing Tinggi City, North Sumatra Province, Indonesia, with a focus of research on the online-based government bureaucratic service system (Figure 1). The research was conducted in 2021-2022. This research uses descriptive and explanatory methods with a quantitative approach. Descriptive research is a study to describe in detail a particular phenomenon (Lawless and Heymann, 2010). Explanatory research is a study that highlights the relationship between research variables and tests hypotheses (Fisher and Jenny, 2004).
2.1 DATA TYPE

The type of data used in this study is quantitative data and is supported by qualitative data. The data taken is in the form of primary data supported by secondary data (Newcomer et al., 2015; Luis et al., 2016). Primary data was obtained from questionnaires distributed to Tebing Tinggi City government officials. Secondary data are obtained from agencies/agencies, journals, and textbooks related to research both from the Tebing Tinggi City environment and other related areas. Data collection was carried out by interview method using a questionnaire instrument that has been designed in a structured manner. The answers given by respondents to the questionnaire given for analysis were given grades 1-5 with very low /bad to very high /good criteria.
2.2 POPULATION AND SAMPLE

Population is a generalized area consisting of subjects/objects that have certain qualities and characteristics that are applied by researchers to be studied and then conclusions are drawn (Acharya, 2013). The population in this study is the entire government apparatus in Tebing Tinggi City as government bureaucratic service actors. The population refers to data from the Tebing Tinggi City Government in 2019, which is 2,769 people from the Tebing Tinggi City Government. A sample is a subset (subset) of a population unit (Acharya, 2013). The sample size is determined using the Slovin formula (Tejada and Joyce, 2012; Ellen, 2012), with an error rate of 6% as follows:

\[
n = \frac{N}{1+N(e)^2} = \frac{2.769}{1+(2.769 \times 0.005625)} = 2527.45 = 253
\]  

Information:

\[
n = \text{Sample} \quad N = \text{Population} \quad d = \text{Precession (60.0 \%) = 0.0036}
\]

Based on the formula above, the number of samples for this research is 253. Sampling is carried out by probability sampling, which is a sampling technique that provides equal opportunities for each element (member) of the population to be selected as a member of the sample (Hájek, 1989). Before the hypothesis test is carried out, instrument tests (questionnaires) and classical assumption tests (normality, validity and reliability) are carried out. These preliminary tests refer to the standard preliminary test procedure (Lumley et al., 2002; Arikunto, 2006).

2.3 DATA ANALYSIS TECHNIQUE

2.3.1 Analysis of Apparatus Readiness Level

To analyze the level of readiness of the apparatus in the application of online-based service bureaucracies, quantitative descriptive analysis was used. Data from various aspects of apparatus readiness are quantified using the scoring method to produce ordinal types of data. Scoring analysis is used to provide an assessment of the indicators of each variable so that the weight of each parameter that has been determined previously can be known. The rating scale for each of these parameters is used to facilitate the
implementation of the assessment. Each parameter in this assessment has the same size, thus the assessment can be done by adding up the numbers from each of these parameters. This method is called the judgment of similarity (Larkey and Arthur, 2005).

The readiness level of the online-based bureaucratic service apparatus is classified into 5 levels of readiness, from very low (very unprepared) to very high (very ready), with an interval of acceptance scores as shown in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Readiness Category</th>
<th>Score Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Very Low/Very Unprepared</td>
<td>253-455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Low/Not Ready</td>
<td>456-657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Moderate/Not Ready</td>
<td>658-860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>High/Ready</td>
<td>861-1062</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Very High/Highly Ready</td>
<td>1063-1265</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Designed based on samples

2.3.2 Analysis of the Effect of Apparatus Readiness on Socio-Economic Development Programs

Analysis of the influence of apparatus readiness (including understanding/insight variables, mastery of technology, mental development, apparatus moral development, formal education, informal education, and material incentives) on the socio-economic development program in Tebing Tinggi City was carried out using multiple linear regression analysis techniques. The basic regression model used is as follows:

\[ Y = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1X_1 + \alpha_2X_2 + \alpha_3X_3 + \alpha_4X_4 + \alpha_5X_5 + \alpha_6X_6 + e \] (2)

Information:

\( Y_i \) = Socio-economic development program
\( \alpha_i \) = independent variable regression coefficient
\( X_1 \) = Understanding/insight
\( X_2 \) = Technology mastery
\( X_3 \) = Mental coaching
\( X_4 \) = Apparatus moral development
\( X_5 \) = Formal education
\( X_6 \) = Informal education
\( X_7 \) = Material incentives
3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 APPARATUS READINESS IN ONLINE-BASED BUREAUCRATIC SERVICE

Online-based bureaucratic services according to Mayor Regulation No. 39 of 2017 concerning the Utilization of Information and Communication Technology in the Tebing Tinggi City Government Environment are services in the form of sending or receiving data and information electronically and connected directly from one place to another through communication media. The data and information sent and/or received from and by the Tebing Tinggi City Government can be of various types. The data and information can only be in the form of news info, announcements or socialization, documents, correspondence, access and licensing, and others that are growing day by day in line with the needs of the community.

The descriptive statistics in this study include the minimum, maximum, mean (average), and standard deviation values. The following are the results obtained for each variable:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable Description</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Socio-Economic Development Services/Programs</td>
<td>3.6736</td>
<td>.73489</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding/Insight</td>
<td>3.5753</td>
<td>.85665</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology Mastery</td>
<td>3.5914</td>
<td>.82400</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Development</td>
<td>3.0605</td>
<td>.96935</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moral Development</td>
<td>3.4960</td>
<td>1.06343</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal education</td>
<td>4.0081</td>
<td>.75383</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material Incentive</td>
<td>3.6532</td>
<td>.88563</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed from Primary Data

Based on Table 2, above it can be described that the average score value of the apparatus readiness variable is 906. The score shows that the level of readiness of the bureaucratic apparatus in Tebing Tinggi City is in ready condition. The highest aspect of readiness is formal education with a score of 1,014, where the majority of bureaucratic officials in Tebing Tinggi City have diploma-3 to undergraduate education. The lowest aspect of readiness is mental coaching with a score of 774. This aspect of quality is related to commitment, discipline, sincerity, and loyalty in work. Facts show that this aspect is the weakest in Tebing Tinggi City. There is no aspect of the readiness of the apparatus in implementing online-based bureaucratic services that are categorized as very good.

Public services are carried out by various RAOs and Regional Technical Service Units (RTSU) by the service sector which is the main task and function. Referring to the
Tebing Tinggi Mayor Decree no. 28 of 2016 concerning the Regional Apparatus Organization of Tebing Tinggi City, there is a Regional Secretariat, Regional People's Representative Council Secretariat, Inspectorate, 18 agencies, 3 regional level agencies and 5 sub-districts which are RAOs within the Tebing Tinggi City Government. Among these RAOs, in general, they have implemented various forms of online-based bureaucratic services, either directly controlled by the OPD concerned or managed through and/or in collaboration with RAOs whose proxy is in charge of communication management and information technology.

The same thing is also owned by other agencies, agencies, and units within the Tebing Tinggi City Government. The enthusiasm and efforts to build an online-based service system have been evenly distributed across all elements of the city government, but their sincerity in carrying out migration in totality is still not evenly distributed. The availability of online platforms has also been evenly distributed in all agencies in Tebing Tinggi City, but there is still much service content that is not filled with the information needed. Better policies, efforts, and commitments are still needed from the mayor and all levels of the public service apparatus in Tebing Tinggi.

Based on field observations, interviews with resource persons, and search results through the websites of the Tebing Tinggi City Government, RAO, Agencies, and Work Units, almost all government agencies in Tebing Tinggi City have service facilities in the form of a website. The majority of these websites are a unidirectional communication medium from the apparatus to the community. Some of the unidirectional information contains content that is needed by the community such as information on the registration of new students, information on job vacancies, information on employee recruitment, and the like. However, the majority of the information available is more of a news story on activities and achievements carried out by the RAO, agencies, and units within the Tebing Tinggi City Government.

In general, it is not only the City of Tebing Tinggi that has not been maximized in carrying out information technology-based service functions. Many regencies/cities in Indonesia also found conditions that were not much different. In the case study in Palu City, based on research results Nur (2014), it was reported that the Palu City Government had also implemented e-government as mandated by Presidential Instruction No. 3 of 2003 in its government environment, but the results were very unsatisfactory. The Palu City Government is reportedly still half-hearted (less serious). The target community is
still untouched, especially in supporting the quality of service in every RTSU in Palu City. The lack of good e-government development planning is cited as the cause of the non-maximum results of the program (Nur, 2014).

In other cases in Merauke Regency Irawan (2018), it is also not much different, where the results of the research show that the development of e-government as a form of public service in Merauke Regency has not fully run well. The problem that is still an inhibiting factor in the Merauke Regency is the lack of government support in the form of regulations and the lack of socialization in the community. Then coupled with the still weak capabilities in terms of human resources and infrastructure resources which are important elements in creating electronic-based public services, infrastructure that is constrained by geographical areas and people's mindsets who are more comfortable with manual systems than electronic-based ones (Irawan, 2018).

At the village level, the success of the “Siapmanda” Android-based application in Lubuk Raya Village, Tebing Tinggi City is enough to provide evidence that the online-based government bureaucratic service program in a regulatory and technical manner is necessary to be carried out completely. However, there may be still non-regulative and technical factors that are a problem so that the service system cannot be successfully developed on a larger scale, namely at the sub-district and Tebing Tinggi levels. Cultural factors and the mentality of the bureaucratic apparatus can be analyzed further about the ineffectiveness of this online-based service system. It is undeniable that with online-based services, the intensity of face-to-face contact between the service apparatus and the people served is minimal or even non-existent. This could potentially lead to the loss of opportunities for service irregularities in the form of transactional bureaucracy.

3.2 THE EFFECT OF ONLINE-BASED GOVERNMENT SERVICE BUREAUCRATIC APPARATUS READINESS ON SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM SERVICES

The analysis of the influence of the readiness of the online-based government service bureaucratic apparatus on the socio-economic development program services in the City of Tebing Tinggi was carried out by using multiple linear regression tests. Various forms of models such as log-based equation models and ln have also been tried but have not yielded better results. The test results show the coefficient of determination (R2) is 55.2% (Table 3). This means that the predictor variables used can explain 55.2%
of the diversity in the service variables of the socio-economic development program, while the rest are explained by other variables that are not used in this study and can be recommended for further research.

Table 3. Model Summary of Test Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.743a</td>
<td>.552</td>
<td>.541</td>
<td>.49779</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed from Primary Data
a. Predictors: (Constant), Material Incentives, Formal Education, Mental Development, Understanding/Insight, Technology Mastery, Moral Development

The results of the analysis of variance (ANOVA) of the tested model found that the T-count value was greater than the F-table and the significance value was close to 0 (Table 4), thus the overall predictor variables in this study (material incentives, formal education, mental coaching, understanding/insight, mastery of technology, moral coaching) are simultaneously declared to have a significant effect on Community Socio-Economic Development Services / Programs.

Table 4. F Test ANOVA Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>73.675</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12.279</td>
<td>49.553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>59,719</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>248</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>133,394</td>
<td>247</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed from Primary Data
a. Dependent variable: community socio-economic development services/programs
b. Predictors: (constant), material incentives, formal education, mental development, understanding/insight, technology mastery, moral development

Based on the results of the analysis, it is stated that the acceptance/readiness of the apparatus in the application of the online-based government bureaucratic service model has a significant effect on the service of the community's socio-economic development program. This influence also has a positive (unidirectional) relationship, which means that the higher the level of readiness of the community as a target group of services that will use online-based service products, the more it will improve the quality of service for community socio-economic development programs. In this analysis, the acceptance/readiness of the apparatus is measured from several aspects, namely understanding/insight, mastery of technology, mental development, moral development of the apparatus, formal education, informal education, and material incentives.
Public services are the basic pillars of people-based governance, substantially an understanding has been built to realize public services by the corridors of good governance (Sadhana, 2010). Such understanding is thematically the fundamental reason for the public's will to compile legal instruments to build public servants that put forward the principles of democracy, transparency, accountability, and responsibility with a new paradigm (the new paradigm) changing the bureaucracy as a served officer into a new paradigm, public servant. One of the important aspects that can be used as a solution in facing the challenges and constraints of public services is the existence of mutual understanding and mutual understanding between the bureaucratic apparatus of public servants and the public who need services to comply with applicable laws and regulations, especially in public services.

Table 5. Partial Test Results of Each Estimator Variable (t-test)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Constant)</td>
<td>.755</td>
<td>.194</td>
<td>3.889</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding/Insight</td>
<td>.016</td>
<td>.054</td>
<td>.019</td>
<td>.302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology Mastery*</td>
<td>.273</td>
<td>.057</td>
<td>.306</td>
<td>4.825</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Development</td>
<td>.046</td>
<td>.052</td>
<td>.060</td>
<td>.872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moral Development*</td>
<td>.097</td>
<td>.047</td>
<td>.141</td>
<td>2.076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal education</td>
<td>.084</td>
<td>.051</td>
<td>.086</td>
<td>1.638</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material Incentive*</td>
<td>.292</td>
<td>.045</td>
<td>.351</td>
<td>6.496</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed from Primary Data

a. Dependent variable: community socio-economic development services/programs

*) Significant at 95% confidence level

Based on the results of the partial test (t-test), not all predictor variables have a significant effect on the services/programs of the socio-economic development of the community. From Table 5, it is known that the significant predictor variables at the 95% confidence level include technology mastery, moral development, and material incentives. All of these influences are also positive, which means that the higher the level of mastery of technology, moral development, and material incentives will affect the better services/programs of socio-economic development of the community. The other variables such as understanding/insight, mental development, and formal education have no significant effect.
3.2.1 Technology mastery

Mastery of online-based service technology by the government bureaucratic apparatus is a significant factor. The use of technology is undeniably an important factor in online-based government bureaucratic services. In general, the functions of technological facilities in bureaucratic services include (Wibawa, 2012);

a. Speeding up the work execution process (saving time);
b. Increase the productivity of goods and services;
c. The accuracy of the size/quality of the product is guaranteed by the delivery of the movement of the service actors with sufficient room facilities;
d. Brings a sense of comfort;
e. Generate a feeling of satisfaction and reduce the emotional nature of the organizer.

In the geographical condition of the State of Indonesia which is an archipelago, the existence of information and communication technology has a very important role in government bureaucratic services (Tangkilisan, 2005). The development of the world of information has been so rapid, that the discovery of information technology is increasingly sophisticated and cheaper, so it is efficient and promises services that increasingly attract public interest (Sudarto, 2006). Therefore, the government must also take advantage of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), especially with the increasing volume of work and the increasing number of advantages of using ICT, namely efficient, productive, and transparent results. To increase the role and output of bureaucratic performance, technological innovation through e-government is needed (Lionardo, 2006). In this perspective, e-government must be interpreted as an instrument of public service policy through information technology that can distribute people's desires in an infinite catchment area. If the government can realize this idea, it will have a direct impact on the quality of public services provided now and in the future.

There have been several bureaucratic service innovations that have been carried out using technology, generally carried out by city governments, large agencies, and provincial and district/city offices in Indonesia. For example, service innovation strategies in improving service quality at the Surabaya City Land Affairs Office II (Hilda, 2014); implementation of public e-government in every service-based RTSU in Palu City (Nur, 2014); research on innovation conducted by the Integrated Licensing and Investment Service Agency of Bogor City Winoto (2000) Meanwhile, innovation at the
village level was also found in Kebraon Village, Surabaya City, through research conducted by (Warsito, 2016). Technology-based and communication-based public service innovations in the service of reports on security and social security disturbances through the "online kentongan" of the Jember Police (Winoto, 2000); Modernization and innovation in public services through e-government in Denpasar City; E-government-based public service innovation: a case study of the Ogan Lopian application of the Purwakarta Regency Communication and Information Office (Atthahara, 2018). Many more articles review the implementation of the IT and online technology-based government bureaucratic service model that has been researched and reported.

Online technology-based bureaucratic services allow city planners and service officials to use the systems used to understand their service development patterns. Based on Lee and Lee (2014) Online-based bureaucratic services can also provide useful guidelines for service program designers to properly evaluate the advantages and disadvantages of the characteristics of the services performed. The role of technology in improving bureaucratic services to accelerate development is also widely carried out in other parts of the world, as reported in India (Praharaj et al., 2018), Saudi Arabia (AlMulhim, 2023), and the European Union (Casalino et al., 2014). In the European Union, the implementation of e-government contributes significantly in the form of cost savings of around 50% and improved quality and safety of public services. Similar research in countries with varying levels of e-government development and maturity has been shown to improve the operation of information systems and can provide substantial benefits for development services. Case study in China, technology plays an important role in improving the quality of development services in its development areas (Lin et al., 2017). To get the best benefits, the service infrastructure development policy is divided into three main areas with a focus on the characteristics of the region. In this case, the development of internet-based service infrastructure is focused on the central and western regions which are dense industrial areas so that people can fully utilize the internet as a factor of production (Komnios et al., 2013).

3.2.2 Moral development

Based on One of the basic weaknesses in public services in Indonesia is the issue of morality (Sadhana, 2010). According to Sadhana, ethics is a concept that can describe what is contained in morals, and explain what is right and what is wrong (code of
conduct). While the final product of the bureaucracy is a public service. Thus, ethics is one of the most decisive factors and a measure of the satisfaction of the public being served as well as a measure of the success of public service organizations. This is in line with the results obtained in research related to the implementation of online-based government bureaucratic services in Tebing Tinggi City. In this study, the variable of mental development and moral development of the apparatus is a significant and positive factor affecting the service of the community socio-economic development program. The earnest efforts of a government in the mental and moral development of the regional apparatus will have a positive and significant impact on improving various types of program services related to the socio-economic development of people in urban areas.

The strong influence of the variable of moral development of the apparatus in government bureaucratic services was also reported in a study in Manado City also shows that the lack of optimal professionalism of public services by the bureaucratic apparatus at the Malalayang Sub-district Office, Manado City, is caused by, among others, the lack of understanding, appreciation, and practice of the bureaucratic apparatus towards the values or ethical norms of the bureaucracy. With linear regression analysis and simple correlation, it is concluded that bureaucratic ethics has a positive functional relationship and has a significant effect on the professionalism of public services (Pai et al., 2016). Potolau's research in Bitung City also revealed the same thing (Potolau, 2020). Based on the results of research with a quantitative approach, it is concluded that bureaucratic ethics directly and indirectly affect the quality of public services. Employee performance also affects directly and indirectly the quality of public services. Together, bureaucratic ethics and employee performance affect the quality of public services.

Although various journals report on the importance of ethical, moral, and mental factors of the apparatus and society in the service of the government bureaucracy, in reality, these forms of ethical and moral violations are difficult to trace, let alone eradicate. Research AlMulhim (2023), concludes that the fundamental problem in the process of public service in Indonesia is ethics. There are no universal standards of norms or ethics as well as sanctions that specifically regulate violations committed by officials in public services. However, moral or ethical violations in public services are difficult to trace and prove, because of the habits of the Indonesian people who consider it taboo to open disgrace, including in public service problems. Substantively, it is not easy to achieve maturity and ethical autonomy, therefore it is likely that moral or ethical
violations in public services in Indonesia will continue to occur. The moral issue of apparatus in developing countries is often a long and incomplete discussion. Not only in Indonesia, many studies report the same thing. Research in Africa also reported similar findings, where low morality and corrupt bureaucrats make development activities not evenly distributed, but rather enjoyed more by entrepreneurs (Yeboah et al., 2016).

Conceptually, the morality of the apparatus is closely related to the success rate of servants and development (Demmke et al., 2008; Fernandez dan Rainey, 2017). Ndikumana states that morality is made, not born. The implication is that in addition to the higher wage approach, governments need to invest in building systems and enforcing laws to prevent corruption (Ndikumana, 2006). Countries that want success in advancing their development must first be able to do various strategic things, including moral reform of their bureaucracy in service (McDonnell, 2020).

3.2.3 Material incentives

Regarding the aspect of material incentives, this is often a major issue in bureaucratic services in Indonesia, maybe even throughout the world. The main disease of the bureaucratic mentality is a corrupt bureaucracy and the existence of illegal fees in various public service activities. Several factors cause a person to commit corruption and illegal levies based on Ramadhani (2007), namely:

a. Abuse of authority. A person's position or authority can commit disciplinary violations by individuals who carry out illegal levies.

b. Mental factors. The character or behavior of someone selfish in acting and controlling himself.

c. Economic factors. Income that can be said to be insufficient for the needs of life is not proportional to the duties/positions carried out making someone encouraged to do pungli.

d. Cultural factors and organizational culture. The culture that is formed in an institution that is constantly against extortion and bribery can make extortion commonplace.

e. Limited human resources.

f. Weak control and supervision system by superiors.

Therefore, material incentives become something important to be considered by policymakers in every city government if they want to implement online-based
government hierarchical services. Forms of material incentives can be implemented in various approaches, such as a direct wage approach, an achievement credit system that is rewarded with material equivalents, socio-economic security that has equality with the material acquisition as well as other creative forms and approaches that can be built in a just system.

Philosophically, it is a transactional bureaucracy that will indeed be eliminated by reforming the service bureaucracy in government agencies. Transformative bureaucratic leadership according to theory is always contrary to the transactional leadership model (Burns, 2003). The transformational leadership model essentially emphasizes that a leader needs to motivate his subordinates to carry out their responsibilities more than they expect. The transformational leader must be able to define, communicate, and articulate the vision of the organization, and subordinates must recognize it. In contrast, transactional leadership essentially emphasizes that a leader has a role in determining what his subordinates need to do to achieve organizational goals. Besides that, transactional leaders tend to focus on completing organizational tasks. To motivate their subordinates to carry out their responsibilities, transactional leaders rely heavily on a system of rewarding and punishing their subordinates (Krishnan dan Srinivas, 1985). Transactional leadership is a leadership model in which one person takes the initiative to make contact with other people for a reward exchange, focusing on rewards or punishments with a performance bargaining process (Fairholm, 2001). Conversely, the professionalism of the apparatus can encourage the achievement of good government and the purpose of building itself. The results of research in Riau, Indonesia show that the implementation of the competence of the local government apparatus and the professionalism of the internal government control apparatus has a significant effect on the implementation of Good Government Governance (GGG), and the implementation of GGG has a significant effect on the performance of local government accountability (Nofiant dan Suseno, 2014).

The condition of implementing online-based government bureaucratic services in Tebing Tinggi City which is not yet optimal requires the local government to immediately improve by prioritizing the digitization program of public services in various possible service sectors. The program is no longer a policy choice, but a necessity amid encouragement and various forms of central government pilots to improve service efficiency through the use of online technology in the industrial 4.0 era. The issuance of
the Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 95 of 2018 concerning the Electronic-Based Government System (EBGS) which is a form of government administration that utilizes information and communication technology to provide services to users, should be a spur to the Tebing Tinggi City government to better integrate various forms of bureaucratic services within the framework of the latest communication technology. The Tebing Tinggi City Government provides a theoretical lesson that various forms of Community Socio-Economic Development Programs carried out using communication technology devices will have a significant effect on regional development in their area. Therefore, it has become a logical and empirical consequence for the Tebing Tinggi City government to no longer hesitate and must be serious about immediately implementing all community socio-economic development program services through the development of an online-based bureaucratic service model. The Tebing Tinggi City Government provides a theoretical lesson that various forms of Community Socio-Economic Development Programs carried out using communication technology devices will have a significant effect on regional development in their area. Therefore, it has become a logical and empirical consequence for the Tebing Tinggi City government to no longer hesitate and must be serious about immediately implementing all community socio-economic development program services through the development of an online-based bureaucratic service model. The Tebing Tinggi City Government provides a theoretical lesson that various forms of Community Socio-Economic Development Programs carried out using communication technology devices will have a significant effect on regional development in their area. Therefore, it has become a logical and empirical consequence for the Tebing Tinggi City government as well as other similar cities to no longer hesitate and must be serious about immediately implementing all community socio-economic development program services through the development of an online-based bureaucratic service model.

4 CONCLUSION

The level of apparatus readiness in various aspects which include understanding/insight, mastery of technology, mental coaching, moral development of apparatus, formal education, informal education, and material incentives in the application of online-based government bureaucratic services in Tebing Tinggi City is considered ready, with the highest aspect being formal education and simultaneously

JOURNAL OF LAW AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT
followed by material incentives, mastery of technology, understanding/insight, moral coaching and mental coaching. The readiness of the apparatus to implement an online-based government bureaucratic service model simultaneously has a significant effect on the services of the community's socio-economic development program. Partially, the factors of mastery of technology, moral development, and material incentives have a significant effect on the service of community socio-economic development programs. Therefore, the Tebing Tinggi City government and other similar city governments should focus and increase their attention to efforts to increase mastery of technology and moral development in the bureaucratic service apparatus, as well as build a performance-based equitable material incentive system. Improving the three aspects of apparatus readiness will encourage the realization of better community socio-economic development program services for urban communities.
REFERENCES


Yulian, M., Sirojuzilam, Lubis, S., Purwoko, A. (2024). Readiness Level of Bureaucratic Apparatus and its Impact on Online-Based Community Socio-Economic Development Program Services; Evidence from Tebing Tinggi City, Indonesia


