PERSPECTIVE OF ENVIRONMENTAL TURBULENCE AS SUSTAINABILITY ON RELATIONSHIP QUALITY, TRUST AND SATISFACTION WITH B2B MSME LOYALTY: VOSVIEWER BIBLIOMETRIC ANALYSIS

ABSTRACT

Objective: This study aims to focus on a literature review of factors that affect B2B customer loyalty by looking at the perspective on a Loyalty Program (LP). Measure how the level of customer loyalty follows the B2B system for MSMEs. Providing the benefits of partnering by establishing good quality relationships, providing a sense of high trust and maximum satisfaction so as to create loyalty.

Method: This study is bibliometric. This research analysis technique uses Vosviewer. Where this technique collects databases from electronic journals in accordance with the scope of discussion. Electronic journal data collection using Publish or Perish based on the year 2016-2022 of the journal publisher.

Result: The result of this study, there is another perspective factor that indirectly affects increasing customer loyalty, namely environment turbulence. So it can be concluded, looking also from the conditions of the internal and external environment that customer loyalty can be formed if the B2B system implemented provides Environmental conditions are good and beneficial for both parties. Limitations in this study have not been held specifically related to the selected B2B objects and only reviewed according to the literature obtained through the electronic journal. The recommendation in this study is to develop B2B potential by linking environmental turbulence factors as factors indirectly strengthen customer loyalty.

Conclusion: This research is valuable because there is an update related to environmental turbulence variables that moderate the study of relationship quality, trust and satisfaction with B2B loyalty to MSMEs. Seeing that B2B conditions are still minimal in the MSME category as the main actor, especially in Indonesia. There needs to be a deeper study related to this research by adding the specifications of the MSME country and region

Keywords: relationship quality, trust, satisfaction, loyalty, B2B, MSMEs.

a Budi Utami, b Sudarmiatin, c Imam Mukhlis, d Wening Patmi Rahayu

ABSTRACT

Objective: This study aims to focus on a literature review of factors that affect B2B customer loyalty by looking at the perspective on a Loyalty Program (LP). Measure how the level of customer loyalty follows the B2B system for MSMEs. Providing the benefits of partnering by establishing good quality relationships, providing a sense of high trust and maximum satisfaction so as to create loyalty.

Method: This study is bibliometric. This research analysis technique uses Vosviewer. Where this technique collects databases from electronic journals in accordance with the scope of discussion. Electronic journal data collection using Publish or Perish based on the year 2016-2022 of the journal publisher.

Result: The result of this study, there is another perspective factor that indirectly affects increasing customer loyalty, namely environment turbulence. So it can be concluded, looking also from the conditions of the internal and external environment that customer loyalty can be formed if the B2B system implemented provides Environmental conditions are good and beneficial for both parties. Limitations in this study have not been held specifically related to the selected B2B objects and only reviewed according to the literature obtained through the electronic journal. The recommendation in this study is to develop B2B potential by linking environmental turbulence factors as factors indirectly strengthen customer loyalty.

Conclusion: This research is valuable because there is an update related to environmental turbulence variables that moderate the study of relationship quality, trust and satisfaction with B2B loyalty to MSMEs. Seeing that B2B conditions are still minimal in the MSME category as the main actor, especially in Indonesia. There needs to be a deeper study related to this research by adding the specifications of the MSME country and region

Keywords: relationship quality, trust, satisfaction, loyalty, B2B, MSMEs.

a Student in Doctoral of Management, Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia, E-mail: budi.utami.2104139@students.um.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0006-4782-2265
b Doctor in Economics Education, Professor, Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia, E-mail: sudarmiatin.fe@u.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1411-8870
c Doctor in Management, Professor, Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia, E-mail: imam.mukhlis.fe@um.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9321-9703
d Doctor in Management, Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia, E-mail: wening.patmi.fe@um.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7081-4216
PERSPECTIVA DA TURBULÊNCIA AMBIENTAL COMO SUSTENTABILIDADE NA QUALIDADE DO RELACIONAMENTO, CONFIANÇA E SATISFAÇÃO COM A FIDELIDADE AO MSME B2B: ANÁLISE BIBLIOMÉTRICA DO VOSVIEWER

RESUMO

Objetivo: Este estudo tem como objetivo focar em uma revisão de literatura de fatores que afetam a lealdade do cliente B2B, analisando a perspectiva de um Programa de Fidelidade (LP). Proporcionar os benefícios da parceria, estabelecendo relacionamentos de boa qualidade, proporcionando uma sensação de alta confiança e máxima satisfação, de modo a criar lealdade.

Método: Este estudo é bibliométrico. Esta técnica de análise de pesquisa usa o Vosviewer. Onde esta técnica coleta bancos de dados de periódicos eletrônicos de acordo com o escopo da discussão. Coleta de dados de periódicos eletrônicos usando Publicar ou Perish com base no ano de 2016-2022 do periódico.

Resultado: O resultado deste estudo, há outro fator de perspectiva que afeta indiretamente o aumento da fidelidade do cliente, ou seja, a turbulência do ambiente. Então pode ser concluído, olhando também das condições do ambiente interno e externo que a lealdade do cliente pode ser formada se o sistema B2B implementado fornece condições ambientais são boas e benéficas para ambas as partes. As limitações deste estudo não foram realizadas especificamente relacionadas aos objetos B2B selecionados e apenas revisadas de acordo com a literatura obtida através da revista eletrônica. A recomendação neste estudo é desenvolver o potencial B2B, vinculando fatores de turbulência ambiental, já que os fatores indiretamente fortalecem a lealdade do cliente.

Conclusão: Esta pesquisa é valiosa porque há uma atualização relacionada a variáveis de turbulência ambiental que moderam o estudo da qualidade de relacionamento, confiança e satisfação com lealdade B2B às MPMEs. Vendo que as condições B2B ainda são mínimas na categoria MSME como o ator principal, especialmente na Indonésia. É necessário aprofundar o estudo relacionado com esta investigação, acrescentando as especificações do país e região MPME.


1 INTRODUCTION

In general, the industrial business world sees that a customer is the main target that must be maintained (Kolte et al., 2021). Especially seeing from customers who fall into the Business to Business (B2B) category who rely on these suppliers (customers) to provide supply targets in an industrial business (Kolte et al., 2022). Various ways are measured to see how much influence customers have on the business they run (Lawrence &; Mauthe, 2022). Loyal customers are valuable assets in B2B, because they become permanent suppliers and repeat supply activities at the parent business (Stathopoulou &;
This is supported by improving the sustainability of customers to be carried out marketing strategies in the form of Loyalty Programs (LP) which provide financial and non-financial benefits to customers (Evanschitzky, H, et. al., 2011); (Ertz, M., Caraccas, F., & Sarigollu, E., 2016). This program was launched with the aim of establishing good relationship quality, reducing redirects and improving customer sustainability systems, thus reaching a high loyalty point (Corbishley, KM, 2017). There is support from previous researchers regarding theoretical studies of the contribution of B2B to the implications of digitalization such as B2B branding, service, innovation, and trust. There is an imbalance in the quality of relationships in digitalization and B2B (Hofacker et al., 2020); (Bullemore-campbell & Tautiva, 2023)

The existence of this LP provides structure and components that aim equally in improving the quality of relationships and creating more significant benefits (Henderson et al., 2011). The existence of relationships with customers has an impact on them on the basis of customer loyalty (Kolte et al., 2022). Previous research has illustrated that the nature of relationships in various contexts and aspects also affects salespeople and customers (Liu et al., 2011), and fellow business partners (Chumpitaz, Caceres & Paparoidamis, 2007; Nyaga &; Whipple, 2011), and also related companies and fellow customers (Aurier &; Séréde Lanauze, 2012).

There are also studies that explain the inherent structural altruistic, consumeristic and egoistic that has a construct relationship between relationship quality with commitment, satisfaction and trust (Omar et al., 2013; Ou et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2015). When all have a strong influence and receive benefits, the value of the quality of the relationship will be valuable to the customer (Mimouni-Chaabane &; Volle, 2010; Palmatier et al., 2006).

Looking at various research sources that have been studied from various countries, China is a country that continues to launch customer loyalty targets to maintain international standards Cromhout et al. (2016). This understanding is carried out to generate loyalty from various components that are still minimal. Therefore, there is still time to improve the offers given to them. This understanding of LP is used as an important reason. First, suppliers/customers have to spend a lot of money such as borrowed money to achieve more profit in running their LPs, it is important to understand the structure and effective use of LPs to achieve maximum loyalty and profit between B2B. Second, some customers rely on LP forms to get additional transactions by applying for high loans and...
overcoming the impact of turbulence in the field due to pressure on the surrounding environment. The obstacle is that it often reduces production costs so that it does not reach the supply target. Therefore, this program is expected to help meet customer needs to better run the B2B system, especially retaining customers who are already in the loyal category.

This study wants to discuss future research that will be researched by academics to evaluate marketing research. The following are the topic considerations that will be discussed in this study.

RQ1: What are the general publication trends and topic areas related to publishing output in marketing?
RQ2: What are the most cited journals that categorize relationship quality, trust, satisfaction, and environmental turbulence on loyalty levels in B2B marketing research?
RQ3: What are the most referenced articles in research that influence loyalty in terms of the number of citations?
RQ4: What are the new scope and trends discussed in B2B loyalty articles?

This research will focus on discussing how much the perspective of the benefits of this loyalty program on relationship quality and satisfaction with customer loyalty based on the literature review. In B2B systems, this problem still provides high complexity with pros and cons that have not provided clear specifications to form high loyalty. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to develop a theoretical study related to the perspective relationship of reciprocal relationships and the effects of benefits on LP that are identified from consumeristic, altruistic, and egoistic sources) on the quality of relationships consisting of a sense of trust, commitment, and satisfaction. Thus, the influence of customer loyalty on the B2B system emerges based on a literature review with the Bibliometrics VosViewer method.

This study builds on previous research that explained the relationship between three components of relationship quality, namely trust, commitment and satisfaction (Jones et al., 2018), which leads to the level of customer loyalty (Francisco-Maffezzolli et al., 2014). The form of LP carried out is consumeristic "signaling direct tangible and financial benefits", altruistic "good cause with customers not getting material benefits, egoistic" providing a sense of well-being and achievement from behavior (Feiler et al., 2012; Amos et al., 2015).
This research is also supported by Sánchez-Rebull, (2018) who has conducted a literature review on satisfaction related to customer loyalty. He conducted a literature review on 580 articles published in 43 journals from 1988-2016. The discussion in the study was based on 150 articles cited. The results show that there are variables of customer loyalty that are often carried out on service quality, causing customer satisfaction. Automatic results show how important the relationship between relationship quality, satisfaction and customer loyalty.

Setyariningsih, Hidayat & Utami (2022) explained the quality of the relationship between customer satisfaction and loyalty in the literature review system as many as 200 scopus index articles. After getting 200 articles will be filtered back so that they get 95 themes that fit the category from 2010 to 2015. The results of the analysis identified that in general the level of customer breadth has relationship quality that can affect customer loyalty.

Previous research also conducted an empirical study on the Milan Railway company (KAM) in Italy which stated that the existence of value-added services in the use of attributes as one of the main positive factors in the system increases customer satisfaction. So that overall customer satisfaction has an influence on the loyalty of attribute use (Allen et al., 2020)

This research is also supported by previous research from Raza (2020) which explained that the satisfaction dimension has a significant positive influence on bank customers in Pakistan. And customer satisfaction is supported by a positive and significant influence on customer loyalty. Furthermore, the influence of customer satisfaction and trust on loyalty is not significant when products are offered with a short and unstructured period of time (such as product discounts / promos) (Pan, 2012).

From various empirical studies that show there are still many differences related to this research both in terms of country, the influence of relationship quality, satisfaction with loyalty and differences related to the object studied.

This study provides a sustainable system from a literature review from Setyariningsih, Hidayat & Utami (2022) who still wants to develop the theme of relationship quality with the form of a B2B system loyalty program. Business-to-business (B2B) is characterized by long-term relationships between companies. Relationship quality, customer satisfaction, and trust are important factors influencing customer loyalty in the B2B market. However, the environmental impact of turbulence on the relationships
between such variables is not yet well understood. This literature review aims to investigate the relationship between relationship quality, satisfaction, trust, and B2B customer loyalty by adding to the findings linking turbulent environmental conditions at higher year levels i.e. 2016-2022. By searching for articles based on publish or perish and analyzing through VosViewer, finally found there are 200 scopus articles. Next, review articles that are in accordance with the discussion and find 158 articles to be used as the basis for discussion in this study.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 TRUST

The foundation of a business is the existence of trust in its partners. There are transaction activities on both sides, each of which has a sense of trust by providing an initial agreement and proving Caceres & Paparoidamis (2007). The element of trust is a symbol of the catalyst of various seller and buyer transactions so that satisfaction is realized according to what is expected (Stathopoulou &; Balabanis, 2016).

Trust is knowledge related to consumers regarding objects, attributes, and benefits offered by sellers (Omar et al., 2013). Trust is a belief that is owned by consumers in the object used. Trust, namely the psychology of consumers regarding the good wishes of others (Ansori 2022). Trust is instilled by consumers to get the best facilities from their business colleagues so that satisfaction is formed in the business process (Dewi and Sudaryana 2020). Trust is the attitude given by consumers to the reliability and integrity of their colleagues in establishing a relationship that produces positive value between the two parties (Zafari, Biggemann, and Garry 2020). With this it can be concluded, that trust is a relationship between work partners that is carried out to fulfill their obligations as expected together.

2.2 SATISFACTION

Satisfaction is a long-term approach by focuses on providing superior customer lifetime value and the main success criterion is developing long-term customer satisfaction (Sánchez-Rebull, (2018). Satisfaction is customer evaluation of their relationship experiences with service providers. Customer satisfaction was found to be a significant predictor of link quality in the Ethiopian mobile telecommunication industry (Jones et al., 2018).
Relationship quality is a representative of customer satisfaction which has influenced customer loyalty in retail principles. Satisfaction is an emotional form of experience related to the services/products offered. The highest achievement of satisfaction is obtained if the purchase and usage stages have occurred. Thus, satisfaction is an expression of pleasure or disappointment that exists in a person based on the expectations and reality obtained (Ou et al., 201).

Achieving customer satisfaction targets can provide various benefits, namely the relationship between partners becomes harmonious so that sustainable customer loyalty is created to become a recommendation system by consumers (Allen et al., 2020). The recommendation system is realized because the first element is word-of-mouth which can provide benefits for the company. The existence of a sense of satisfaction in the quality offered will lead to a feeling of loyalty to customers and even follow the latest trends by seeing the benefits. There are programs offered to consumers such as panic buying, so that they become a powerful marketing force for companies (Raza, 2020).

2.3 RELATIONSHIP QUALITY

Relationship is an effort to create, maintain, and enhance strong relationships with suppliers and stakeholders in marketing or other fields. In general, from (Gummeson, 2017) seeing the level of trust, commitment, and satisfaction of buyers will form a good quality relationship with the company. Meanwhile, according to (Dutta, Walker, and Bergen 1992), the quality of the relationship is the highest key factor that is carried out by the buyer on the seller by showing trust, commitment to sustainability, and the desire to invest in data sources owned by the buyer to make further relations with the seller.

Nyaga & Whipple (2011) explain that all areas of marketing include relationships, trust, and consistent commitment which illustrate the key to the quality of these relationships. Conceptually relationship quality can be shown from trust, satisfaction, and commitment to the buyer (Haim, Noor Hasmini, and Hanaysha 2014). Furthermore, previous research strengthens his research from (Huang 2012) if trust and satisfaction are key indicators of relationship quality. So that the results of these studies prove that it is important to build quality relationships based on dimensions, namely trust, satisfaction, and commitment to provide successful long-term relationships between suppliers and sellers which will create a sense of loyalty.
2.4 LOYALTY B2B

Loyalty is a process form of a series of activities carried out by all areas of marketing including the B2B category. Categorized if before reaching a loyal customer satisfaction will be formed in consumers. Previous research also conducted an empirical study on the Milan Railway company (KAM) in Italy which stated that the existence of value-added services in the use of attributes as one of the main positive factors in the system increases customer satisfaction. So overall customer satisfaction influences the loyalty of attribute use (Allen et al., 2020).

Raza (2020), as a previous researcher, said that the satisfaction dimension has a significant positive effect on bank customers in Pakistan. Furthermore, customer satisfaction can increase the positive and significant influence on customer loyalty. Therefore, the effect of customer trust and satisfaction on loyalty has no significant effect when the product is applied for a short and unstructured period (such as product discounts/promos) (Pan, 2012).

This study provides a sustainable system from a literature review from Setyariningsih, Hidayat & Utami (2022) who still want to develop the theme of relationship quality with the form of a B2B system loyalty program. Business-to-business (B2B) is characterized by long-term relationships between companies. Relationship quality, customer satisfaction, and trust are important factors influencing customer loyalty in the B2B market.

3 METHODOLOGY
3.1 DATA ACQUISITION

This research uses a bibliometric-based literature review system method. The bibliometric method is a research system based on journals that are published comprehensively and structured according to the criteria of the research topic, namely relationship quality, customer satisfaction, and customer loyalty to B2B. The specified article is a scientific paper that has a basic database of Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar in the academic division. Research, namely non-research on a document basis is filtered systematically through specific criteria and specific objectives in electronic publication-based research journals (Yoshikawa et al., 2020). In this research, we chose Scopus as the primary data source because it is the most recognized document worldwide regarding its reputation. Therefore, this study chose the Scopus database as
the main reference source which includes three sub-databases Science Expanded Citation Index, Arts & Humanities Citation Index, Social Science Citation Index, and Multidisciplinary Index. Electronic journals exported from Scopus include comprehensive and detailed data such as "full citations and cited references exported to text files" on publication year, country, author, journal, and institution (Allen, et al., 2020). Keywords, abstract, author, title, and affiliation identity were presented as search types to explore correlation theory and learning in this area. We were able to classify useful data from this data and conduct further analysis and research. Conduct further analysis and research. During the data collection process, we focused on keywords, abstracts, authors, and titles as search types to ensure that we obtained theories and studies relevant to our research field. With the screening and evaluation process, we finally extracted 1,400 valid references from the Scopus database, which will provide important support and references for our research.

3.2 METHODS

The analysis technique used in this study is the Vosviewer application. Vosviewer is one application with a bubble output that forms novelty from a study that is still minimal and maximally conducted. It can be seen through the network, the year of research as well as the big themes that appear in Vosviewer, so that researchers can know the theme that should be raised as a form of findings (Petersen et al., 2015). Vosviewer will provide data mapping of various keywords that appear in the form of bubbles so that they can find out the relationship between keywords through the cluster.

The following is how to present related to the journal search through the database from Publish or Perish (PoP). The existence of this research PoP received 1400 electronic journals from publishers Scopus and Google Scholar for the theme of relationship quality, satisfaction, trust, and customer loyalty. Everything is done through applicable standards such as entering keywords, titles, and abstracts. The research process takes from 2016-2023. The following is the process of searching for electronic journals can be seen in Fig 1.
After searching with PoP proceed to save all electronic journals obtained through RIS and export to Mendeley. Before going to the journal screening process, we see how many journals we have obtained through the journal citation. The following is an explanation of the PoP related to journal citations based on the year of publication can be seen in Figure 2.
Looking at the picture above, it shows that from 2016-2023 there have been 1633 citations that refer to all journals related to the keywords relationship quality, trust, customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. After storing all electronic journal databases found, further more specific screening will be carried out in accordance with the research topic, which is related to B2B. The next process of screening electronic journals obtained from PoP can be seen in Figure 3. The following scheme.

The figure above explains the obligations related to electronic journal screening in accordance with the criteria for general discussion. By combining all journal databases as many as 1400 journals, screening was then carried out until finally getting 158 journals that were included in the category of discussion and material for literature review. Because the focus of discussion in this study is B2B, so the researchers re-evaluated from 175 journals obtained to search more specifically not only based on keywords but more focused on B2B objects. The next process will be screened related to the research topic based on the object. The following screening process can be seen in Figure 4. Below

Figure 4. Journal classification process according to the theme of discussion

From the picture above, it explains that the journal classification process in accordance with the theme of discussion finally obtained 158 journals that are suitable for journal review in this study. The first process is to select articles. Second, read the entire article according to the topic of discussion. Third, classify it specifically and authentically related to the object of research. Fourth, classify based on the recording of the discussion scheme and novelty updates from the journal according to the theme of discussion. Finally, finalization related to journals that will be made the basis for discussion that will be analyzed by the VosViewer application.

4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results of this study show that by using the VosViewer application will get 3 analyses, namely in the form of network visualization, overlay visualization and density
visualization. The first process can be classified in the results of this study based on network visualization based on keyword provisions as follows.

Figure 5. Network Visualization VosViewer based on keywords

It can be seen in the picture above shows that there is a network relationship in each keyword that appears. Such linkages are classified by cluster. There are 9 types of clusters in this study, which are as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster 1</th>
<th>Cluster 2</th>
<th>Cluster 3</th>
<th>Cluster 4</th>
<th>Cluster 5</th>
<th>Cluster 6</th>
<th>Cluster 7</th>
<th>Cluster 8</th>
<th>Cluster 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agency</td>
<td>Marketing capability</td>
<td>Digital servitization</td>
<td>Customer loyalty</td>
<td>Customer experience</td>
<td>Customer relationship management</td>
<td>Brand equity</td>
<td>loyalty</td>
<td>Relationship capability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency Theory</td>
<td>Prospective</td>
<td>Evidence</td>
<td>Firm performance</td>
<td>Difference</td>
<td>Customer satisfaction</td>
<td>Firm value</td>
<td>salesrespon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Quality marketing</td>
<td>Main supplier</td>
<td>Quality</td>
<td>Relational model</td>
<td>Customer trust</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Company</td>
<td>Relational selling</td>
<td>Relational benefit</td>
<td>Relationship quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer</td>
<td>Turbulence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relational Marketing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Modified by researchers (2023)

From the table above, it is explained that there is a relationship between keywords based on 9 clusters. Cluster 1 is agency, agency theory, china, company, consumer,
market and relational marketing. Where cluster 1 is the main factor to find a suitable theory in this study is agency theory. This theory is used in this study because the object of this study is B2B. Cluster 2 is marketing capability, prospective, quality marketing, relational selling and turbulence. In this study in cluster 2 used keywords turbulence. Where the turbulence linkage will strengthen the condition of customers in the field. Cluster 4 is customer loyalty, firm performance, quality and relationship quality. This study uses quality and relationship quality to measure how much the quality of the program provided and the quality of relationships with customers in the B2B process. Finally, cluster 6 is customer relationship management, customer satisfaction and customer trust. The main topic of discussion of this study looks at the relationship between customers in relationship quality, satisfaction and trust in B2B. In clusters 3, 5, 7 and 9 researchers did not take the keywords described because they wanted to narrow the discussion in this study which would be used as a limitation.

It can be concluded that, the focus in this journal is to provide a literature development study on the keywords relationship quality, satisfaction, trust, customer loyalty by linking agency theory to B2B objects and turbulence as novelty in this study.

4.1 IMPLEMENTATION OF RELATIONSHIP QUALITY, SATISFACTION AND TRUST IN CUSTOMER LOYALTY IN B2B

The interconnectedness of a relationship is an integral part of all life. Especially business partnership relationships, the quality of the relationship plays an important role in determining its success and longevity. In this journal, we will discuss the key factors that contribute to the quality of a relationship, including satisfaction, trust, and loyalty based on the recency of the years.

Relationship quality refers to the overall health and well-being of the relationship. It covers various aspects such as communication, intimacy, emotional support, and shared interests. High-quality relationships are characterized by mutual respect, trust, and a willingness to work through common challenges. It is important to note that the quality of relationships is not determined by the absence of conflicts, but rather by how conflicts are resolved. Contentment is an important component of any relationship. This refers to the extent to which individuals are satisfied with their relationship. In romantic relationships, satisfaction is often associated with the level of emotional and physical intimacy that the partner has. In business partnerships, satisfaction is often associated
with the level of success achieved by the partnership. When individuals are satisfied with their relationship, they are more likely to invest time and effort into maintaining it.

Trust is the foundation of any successful relationship. It refers to the belief that individuals have reliability, honesty, and integrity with each other. In romantic relationships, trust is built over time through consistent action and communication. In business partnerships, trust is built through transparency, accountability, and a shared vision. When individuals trust each other, they tend to be vulnerable and open up to each other. Trust is the process of believing in one party the durability, reliability, and integrity of the other party's relationship. If the process in action is of the best interest and will produce positive results for the party given trust (Ansori 2022).

Loyalty refers to the commitment that individuals have to their relationships. It is characterized by a willingness to prioritize relationships over personal interests. In romantic relationships, loyalty is often shown by remaining faithful and committed to a partner. In a business partnership, loyalty is demonstrated by working towards the common goals and objectives of the partnership. When individuals are loyal to their relationships, they are more likely to persevere through challenges and work towards long-term success. Supported by the relationship between keywordss contained in figure 6. The results of the analysis are below.

Figure 6. Overlay Visualization between keywords by year

Source: Vosviewer
The picture above shows that there needs to be a specification that focuses more on keywords in accordance with this study. Bubble in the results of Vosviewer's analysis shows purple, explaining that 2016 was the longest the theme was developed. Meanwhile, the brighter the color shows the novelty of keywords that are still minimal research boxing. So this study chose to associate perspective keywords periodically. See the relationship between relationship quality, satisfaction, trust, and customer loyalty by pointing to turbulence keywords as novelty in this study. The following is specifically based on the results of Vosviewer analysis that describes the relationship between variables, can be seen in figure 7. Below

![Figure 7. Loyalty Visualization Overlay](source: VosViewer)

Several studies have been conducted regarding the relationship between relationship quality, satisfaction, trust, and B2B customer loyalty. The results of research from Moliner, Tena & Gracia (2013) result if commitment, trust and satisfaction are key forms of relationship quality, but the determinant in satisfaction itself is service quality. The existence of good relationship quality can improve and consider the market orientation perceived by customers as a precursor in service quality, commitment and satisfaction. Supported by previous research Samudro et al. (2018) Evaluate related relationships and perceptions of relationship quality with trust and satisfaction, trust with commitment, commitment with loyalty, and satisfaction with loyalty. These results
are the same as before (Hariyanti et al., 2023) which states that a sense of trust in a brand can positively and significantly increase customer loyalty. Also supported by one of the dimensions for creating loyalty is trust. The results of the analysis found that there is a conceptual framework that must be developed with a structure relevant to the context of B2B loyalty. By understanding the framework and relationships between constructions, companies can develop relationship programs intentionally to achieve customer loyalty.

Agency theory deals with contractual relationships between members of a company or organization. The most widely used models focus on two individuals, the behavioral perspective and structure between the principal and (Jensen and Meckling, 1976). The principal delegates decision-making responsibilities to the agent. Both principals and agents are assumed to be rational economic men motivated only by self-interest, but they may differ on preferences, beliefs and information. Agency theory states that agents will behave self-interested which will probably conflict with the interests of the principal. Therefore, the principal will create a mechanism structure to supervise agents in order to restrain opportunistic behavior and follow the will of the principal (Fama and Jensen, 1983)

In real-world marketing problems (Dutta, Walker, and Bergen 1992), a better understanding of the role of agency theory in marketing is important to marketers and valuable to practitioners. It is important to note that most agency models define efficiency from the principal's point of view (Chohan, 2019). The assumption is that the principal is the dominant party in the relationship. Thus, an efficient contract is one that brings the best results to the principal given the constraints imposed by the situation, not one that maximizes the shared utility of both the principal and the agent. Therefore, there is a need for sustainability through the formation of good relationship quality based on elements of trust, satisfaction and loyalty.

A later study of (Huang 2012) found that relationship quality can generate customer loyalty through increased customer satisfaction. Structural equation modeling is performed to explore homogeneous customer groups and test the effects of mediation, thus influencing the quality of corporate relationships leading to customer intention through customer satisfaction. Another study from (Haim, Noor Hasmini, and Hanaysha 2014) discusses the importance of relationship quality as a strategic tool in today's volatile business world. The results of research from (Berenguer-Contrí et al. 2020) show that there is a significant influence of variability in satisfaction, and trust on company
performance. For variables, value and customer relationships have a negative effect due to the influence of the external environment.

In conclusion, relationship quality, satisfaction, trust, and loyalty are important components of any successful relationship. By investing time and effort into these areas, individuals can build strong, healthy, and long-lasting relationships.

Based on research, the relationship between relationship quality, customer trust, customer satisfaction, and customer loyalty in a business-to-business context is critical to a company's success. Positive relationship quality leads to increased customer trust, which in turn leads to higher levels of customer satisfaction. A high level of customer satisfaction results in increased customer loyalty, which is an important factor in long-term business success. Therefore, companies must focus on building strong and healthy relationships with their customers, prioritizing trust, satisfaction, and loyalty to achieve long-term success. However, it is necessary to review again related to the environmental turmoil factors that exist in the object of research.

Figure 8. Overlay Visualization Novelty Turbulence from this study

Source: Vosviewer

In a business-to-business (B2B) context with turbulence, several factors have been identified to influence customer loyalty. A literature review by Long and Khalafinezhad (2020) in the perspective of customer relationship management found that customer
satisfaction and loyalty are positively related. Meanwhile, the framework proposed by (Marjani & Sutisna, 2019) consolidates academic research on loyalty in the context of B2B services and identifies several factors that influence customer loyalty, including attitude loyalty, perceived customer value, service quality, collaboration, and trust.

Trust has been identified as a key factor in influencing customer loyalty in B2B. A study by Garcia et al. (2020) found that customer satisfaction positively affects customer loyalty, and trust mediates the relationship between customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Another study by Long and Khalafinezhad (2020) found that personal trust and business trust positively affect relationship performance in conditions of market turbulence.

Relationship quality has also been identified as a factor influencing customer loyalty in B2B. A study by (Marjani & Sutisna, 2019) found that relationship quality has a positive effect on customer loyalty. Another study by Kim et al. (2005) found that relationship quality and exchange satisfaction positively affect customer loyalty.

Overall, the literature shows that relationship quality, customer satisfaction, customer trust, and customer loyalty are important factors in a B2B context with turbulence. However, the environmental impact of turbulence on the relationships between such variables is not yet well understood. As research from Auh & Shih (2005) shows, relationship quality and exchange satisfaction with loyalty are moderated by environmental conditions such as switching barriers and viable alternatives. These factors can influence each other and ultimately affect customer loyalty. Therefore, businesses operating in this context should focus on building strong relationships with their customers, providing high-quality services, and cultivating trust to increase customer loyalty.

It is important to note that the literature review did not specifically address the moderating effects of turbulence on these factors. More research is needed to explore the impact of turbulence on relationship quality, customer satisfaction, customer trust, and customer loyalty in a B2B context. The following are the second findings of Vosviewer's analysis of this study, which relates relationship quality and loyalty to environmental conditions, can be seen in figure 9. below.
The relationship model is actually an old concept. However, it has once again become the center of discussion among practitioners and scholars in the field of marketing as the idea has undergone changes. The attention paid to relational marketing is influenced by the development of competition for consumers, the labor market, the provision of goods and services, and changes in consumer behavior used to firms. Marketing relationships lead to long-term or loyal relationships between companies and customers.

Relationship marketing has been around for more than three decades, looking at the position of the right conceptual framework in the field of marketing and service B2B systems (Polese, Mele, and Gummesson 2017). The basis of this study is to link this theory with the premise that long-term systems of development depend between sellers and customers in a B2B environment (Sarmento et al., 2015). Goals based on individuals who want to develop good relationships seem to lean towards B2B rather than B2C systems, because the sales volume of industrial market areas makes it difficult to build things like that, plus there are long-term benefits related to B2B processes (Edwards & Baker, 2020).

The importance and involvement of employees to deliver services and impact customer satisfaction and future sales growth has been widely recognized by public
marketing professionals (Bradford, Harper, and Brown 2010; Arli, Bauer, and Palmatier 2018). There are a number of researchers in the field of personal selling and sales management by (Samanta, 2022); (Motahari Farimani, Bagherzadeh, and Mohammadi 2022) explained that the B2B sales landscape can change due to management perceptions, B2B customer service to develop and how the need to develop Partnership strategies with vendors are few.

Research (Badi, Wang, and Pryke 2017); Zafari, Biggemann, and Garry 2020) emphasizing the importance of a relationship approach to B2B relationship management, promoting the delivery of value-added services to encourage sustainable participation. The seller relationship approach is characterized by the capacity to engage and manage services with B2B customers, which directly affects B2B customer satisfaction outcomes (Gummesson 2017).

The findings in this literature review discuss environmental quality (external environment and internal environment). Here managers can strengthen the B2B customer experience through the delivery of professional services that align with the initial partnership agreement. It also provides an opportunity to further explore the interconnections and linkages with the discussion in this study not specifying environmental indicators and other B2B organizations. Organizational and environmental indicators in service companies can contextualize other B2B metrics, such as skills, motivation, talent, and role perception looking at the company's environmental quality conditions. Thus, it can build quality relationships and create customer satisfaction to always be loyal to B2B partnerships.

4.2 DENSITY VISUALIZATION AS THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN RELATIONSHIP QUALITY, SATISFACTION, TRUST AND LOYALTY IS MODERATED BY TURBULENCE ENVIRONMENT IN B2B

The quality of relationships with customers must be formed in various ways so that there are no future conflicts. Seeing that the B2B process is a form of partner business that provides a mutual benefit program between suppliers and retailers. This research provides reinforcement of keywords trust and satisfaction in the formation of customer loyalty. The density of visualization in the results of this research analysis explains the newness of the turbulence environment. The results of the analysis show that the presence of striking bubble colors is a keyword that has been widely researched and
has become the basic word for novelty searches. As for the bubble color that is still vague, it is a keyword that is still minimal research and needs to be reviewed and developed further. The following is an explanation of Density Visualization in this study can be seen in figure 9.

Figure 10. Density Visualization between keywords

In the picture above explains that, how the density in the network between keywords/variables to be studied. This study looked at how the most striking bubble colors would be used as a basis for finding new related variables. Researchers in this context discuss things that affect customer loyalty. It can be found if much appears in visual density. The results of the analysis from Vosviewer show that the quality of relationships, satisfaction and trust are still minimal research. Therefore, researchers add perspective keywords that can affect customer loyalty. Furthermore, researchers produced findings that there is a turbulence environment which here still has no direct discussants at all. It can be concluded, that visual density in research is to produce novelty in the form of environment turbulence to strengthen the influence of customer loyalty.

In the context of B2B, it is explained that related to internal and external environmental conditions can affect customer loyalty. Looking at the partnership agreement agreed to benefit both parties. The results of research from Farooqi (2014) if
the concept of relationship quality adequately describes the simultaneous influence on customer loyalty. Look at the level of relationship quality, the quality of relationships with suppliers and how to maintain good relationships with suppliers themselves. This is also a contradiction in research from (Dewi and Sudaryana 2020) on aspects of behavior and loyalty attitudes in Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs). Where this study explains that the existence of organizational environmental conditions cannot make the quality of relationships affect customer loyalty. Thus, the level of quality of supplier relationships does not play an important role in directly affecting B2B customer loyalty. It can be concluded that if necessary, development related to what factors support the influence of customer loyalty such as the existence of environment turbulence strengthens this research as novelty.

5 CONCLUSION

The conclusion of this study is to review the literature review of factors related to customer loyalty. Where, this study takes the variables of relationship quality, satisfaction and trust as the foundation that affects customer loyalty. The purpose of this study is to develop a theoretical study related to the perspective relationship of reciprocal relationships and the effects of benefits on LP that identify consumeristic, altruistic and egoistic sources on relationship quality consisting of a sense of commitment, trust and satisfaction that targets the level of customer loyalty. Supported by a theoretical agency as a strong foundation in linking the B2B process of this research. The results of the analysis show that there are new findings related to factors that affect customer loyalty is environment turbulence, seeing that environmental conditions have strong support related to B2B processes. so as to create strong loyalty if environmental conditions are healthy and provide benefits to fellow B2B customers. Limitations in this study have not been held specifically related to the selected B2B objects and only reviewed according to the literature obtained through the electronic journal. The recommendation in this study is to develop B2B potential by linking environmental turbulence factors as factors indirectly strengthen customer loyalty.
REFERENCES


