ANALYSIS ON ELECTION MODELS: EXAMINING THE INDONESIAN CASE

a Wahab Tuanaya, b Marno Wance, c Muhtar

ABSTRACT

Objective: The upcoming concurrent general election in 2024 in Indonesia is one of very interesting issues of democracy to research. One of which is the idea of a model of electoral governance. This is surely a challenge for future democracy development, both currently underway in Indonesia and in the context of democratic dynamics in other countries. Therefore, to get a model of concurrent elections in Indonesia, a literature review is needed to analyze articles and documents posted on Scopus and Google Scholar which are available globally. This can help researchers particularly in Indonesia to evolve the theory of electoral governance.

Method: This literature research aims to find gaps in election governance research that has been carried out and to describe the agenda of concurrent elections in Indonesia. This study found 120 documents from the Scopus database and 100 documents from Google Scholar that were most relevant with the election model keywords.

Result: The research found that there are still a small number of Indonesian researchers who have published documents on this theme by which they become references globally.

Conclusion: The relevant research themes can become theme issues, namely political accountability, political competition experience, electoral management design, organizing elections, voter management, and democratic election systems. The findings of this literature review research can be a reference for researchers who want to determine the novelty of relevant research in the future.

Keywords: democracy development, electoral theory evolution, concurrent election model, NVivo 12 Plus.

Received: 26/06/2023
Accepted: 20/09/2023
DOI: https://doi.org/10.55908/sdgs.v11i8.1080

a Doctor in Public Administration, Faculty Member at Government Science, Universitas Pattimura, E-mail: wahabtuayafisip@gmail.com, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0001-9236-8149
b Doctor in Public Administration, Faculty Member at Government Science, Universitas Pattimura, E-mail: marno.wance@fisip.unpatti.ac.id, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6663-7598
c Doctor in Public Administration, Faculty Member at Government Science, Universitas Pattimura, E-mail: muhtartisipunpatti@gmail.com, Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0000-8960-7615
ANÁLISE SOBRE MODELOS ELEITORAIS: EXAMINANDO O CASO DA INDONÉSIA

RESUMO

Objetivo: A próxima eleição geral simultânea em 2024 na Indonésia é uma das questões muito interessantes da democracia para a pesquisa. Uma delas é a ideia de um modelo de governança eleitoral. Este é seguramente um desafio para o desenvolvimento futuro da democracia, tanto atualmente em curso na Indonésia como no contexto da dinâmica democrática noutros países. Portanto, para obter um modelo de eleições simultâneas na Indonésia, uma revisão de literatura é necessária para analisar artigos e documentos publicados na Scopus e Google Scholar que estão disponíveis globalmente. Isso pode ajudar pesquisadores, particularmente na Indonésia, a desenvolver a teoria da governança eleitoral.

Método: Esta pesquisa de literatura visa encontrar lacunas na pesquisa de governança eleitoral que tem sido realizada e descrever a agenda de eleições simultâneas na Indonésia. Este estudo encontrou 120 documentos da base de dados Scopus e 100 documentos do Google Scholar que foram mais relevantes com as palavras-chave do modelo de eleição.

Resultado: A pesquisa constatou que ainda há um pequeno número de pesquisadores indonésios que publicaram documentos sobre esse tema pelos quais se tornaram referência mundial.

Conclusão: Os temas de pesquisa relevantes podem se tornar temas temáticos, como responsabilidade política, experiência de competição política, desenho de gestão eleitoral, organização de eleições, gestão eleitoral e sistemas eleitorais democráticos. Os resultados desta pesquisa de revisão de literatura pode ser uma referência para pesquisadores que querem determinar a novidade de pesquisa relevante no futuro.


1 INTRODUÇÃO

Election-related issues sprang up during the 2009 parliamentary, presidential, and local executive elections as well as during the 2010 voting process at every level, from voter registration through vote tallying. It was discovered that thousands of ineligible voters were listed alongside millions of eligible voters on election rolls. The 44 contending political parties in Indonesia filed objections over the vote count, leading newspaper Kompas in Indonesia declared the April 2009 parliamentary elections to be the worst since 1999. Reporting to Bawaslu any election implementers that compromise the election system (Hillman, 2011). The paper makes the case that electoral fraud cannot be separated from acts of violence, crises of legitimacy, corruption, and other vices. It ends by advising and outlining tactics for overcoming electoral process difficulties and ensuring the viability of democratic governance in the nation (Ismaila & Othuman, 2015). The challenges in achieving administrative efficiency: Electoral governance is most susceptible to mistakes at the level of rule application due to the sheer size and complexity
of the tasks at hand as well as the large number of people involved and the authorized discretion they exercise in handling individuals out (Mozaffar & Schedler, 2002).

The formation of comparisons among several facets of these elections has also been facilitated by the available data about electoral processes throughout the world. Studies of the quality of democracy have either addressed the laws and institutions that determine election conduct descriptively (Sawer 2001; Marchetti 2008), or as independent variables (Lehoucq 2002; Hartlyn, McCoy et al. 2008). The argument about just the public role of political parties in context of their declining representative capacities has also activated rules governing the transparency of electoral procedures, such as campaign financing and the recruitment and selection of candidates (Peschard 2005).

The main challenges for raising the standard of election administration and resolving election-related disputes in Indonesia are the responsibilities between the EMB and the reliance on election commissions on the resources and processes of the executive branch of government. The results are based on participant observation, legal analysis, and discussions with national and local election administrators. Students of democratization and democratic institutions will find the analysis relevant regardless of the main objective of this study being Indonesian electoral governance (Hillman, 2011). The paper makes the argument that electoral fraud cannot be differentiated from acts of violence, crises of legitimacy, corruption, and other vices. It finishes by suggesting and explaining tactics for overcoming electoral process challenges and maintaining the legitimacy of democratic governance in the society. (Ismaila & Othuman, 2015).

The credibility of elections is dependent on how effectively the number of technical tasks that make up electoral governance as rule application are organized and carried out. That credibility may be significantly compromised if operational aspects are not given due consideration. Because of the sheer size and complexity of the responsibilities that have to be completed combined with the vast variety of people involved and the authorized discretion they exercise in carrying out its functions, electoral governance is most prone to errors at the level of rule application (Mozaffar & Schedler, 2002). The Association of African Election Authorities' (AAEA) first chapter of its charter states: "The Association shall have the following purposes: a) the promotion of free and fair elections in Africa; b) the promotion of independent and impartial election organizations and administrators; c) the promotion of public confidence in election
processes through open and transparent electoral procedures; d) the promotion of collaborative elections (Rafael Lopez-Pintor, 2000). In order to discuss the presence of pessimism in this writing regarding the public's participation in politics and their role in bolstering contemporary democracies, this article will encourage readers to read a few chapters of Richard Posner's book Law, Pragmatism, and Democracy. The topic's relevance lies in identifying the boundaries of legal pragmatism in order to build a democratic theory that can be applied to understanding Brazilian reality (Srta Rocha dos Santos, 2018).

A fundamentally decent practice for all EMB activities is transparency. It can help an EMB contest perceptions, identify financial exchange or electoral fraud, demonstrate competence or show predilection for certain ideological positions, and it can increase the legitimacy of an EMB (Pippa Norris, 2011). Managing electoral fraud was the process’ central pillar in Mexico, as it was in other democracies making the move from "electoral authoritarianism," that also aimed to overcome a history of electoral fraud. Although the beginning discussion of electoral governance has focussed at either the election-organizing procedure (Schedler, 2001). The findings of this study indicate that political parties are crucial in Indonesia for ensuring the success of democratic elections. Participating in fair elections while representing the interests of the people (Achmad, 2023). The strengthening and expansion of cultural activities as a method of democratic education in Banyumas society is the research's implication. This improves people's comprehension of democratic values as they are expressed in popular culture and habits (Sadeli & Nasiwan, 2023), The Indonesian Democracy Index is a number that shows the level of development of democracy in all provinces in Indonesia and for formulating planning programs in political development (Muhammad Yahya Matdoan, Muhammad Ahsan, Marno Wance, 2023), This study emphasizes the advantages of interdisciplinary analysis for comprehending the intricate connections between the fields of law and politics (Populista et al., 2021)

Based on the research findings of Solihah (2018) and Casmi (2014) which provide an overview of facing the concurrent elections in 2024, there are several policy recommendations, namely (1). The design of the election model is to avoid direct democratic practices which tend to be transactional, manipulative, corrupt and costly. (2). Strengthening the consolidation of democracy (Casmi Arrsa, 2014). The findings of the 2019 concurrent general election revealed that the legislative election and the presidential
election, need to get attention. (3) Reforming the representation system or party election system (Solihah, 2018). Concurrent elections can run substantially if the government, General Election Commission (KPU) and the House of Representatives of The Republic of Indonesia (DPR RI) can design (1) unification of regulations or laws regarding election implementation, (2) changes dignified political culture (Sinamora, 2019), (3) the modality and victory of political contestation (Wance & Djae, 2019), and (4) the attitude of voters towards candidates (Marno Wance; Bakri La Suhu, 2020). The findings of Ardipandanto (2019) about the quality of election logistics distribution, updating DPT to get carried out on time, increasing the number of KPPS members, and using IT in the vote counting recapitulation process (Ardipananto, 2019). Results of research conducted by Indonesian researchers can provide an illustration that further research is needed to provide recommendations on election governance, management elections, as well as the evolution of the theory of the implementation model of the concurrent election model in Indonesia. The latest research themes can become a good research map for global and national researchers. The latest and still relevant research themes are the concurrent election model, Collaborative Governance, election management, access to election information, digital elections, models of the electoral system and election organizers. Recent and relevant issues can be researched for global and national researchers to contribute to the development of the evolution of electoral governance theories and recommendations.

2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study uses the NVIVO 12 plus data analysis approach. The approach used is very helpful for researchers to carry out a theoretical revolution through publication documents by which they can map out interesting research for further research. This researcher uses the Scopus and Geoogle databases. This research aims to find research gaps that have been done previously on global election governance and especially the concurrent elections that will be held in 2024. The 2024 concurrent elections will hold elections concurrently for the legislative elections (DPRD, DPR RI, and DPD RI), elections of regional heads (governors) and city mayors as well as regency heads and elections for President and Vice President of the Republic of Indonesia. Therefore, it is interesting for researchers in the field of social sciences to evaluate theories and policy recommendations for improving election governance. This study also uses the latest
research methodology by analyzing the Scopus and Google Scholar databases through the NVIVO 12 Plus and VOSviewer software to conduct a literature review on election governance. The research formulates several topics and research theme mapping, namely (1) Mapping of research themes and discussion of election management governance. (2) Mapping issues on model management elections. (3) Electoral politics issue mapping. (4) Mapping the issue of electoral processes.

Based on the formulation of the research question, it can discuss research topics on election governance and concurrent election issues that will be carried out in Indonesia in 2024. The results of this research can increase interest, recommendations, theory evolution and development of the latest research topics and can be used as reference material for scientific community, policy makers, political actors, government and social researchers. The Scopus and Google Scholar data documents can help researchers, especially in Indonesia, to develop studies on models of holding elections in the world.

Figure 1. Research Process Flow

![Flowchart](Data Analysis Process)

Literature research steps according to Figure 1 are a research roadmap or research steps consisting of: (1) Collecting data by searching for sources of scientific publication documents from the Scopus and Google Scholar databases. (2) Data reduction is then used to search and find highly relevant documents by searching based on title, abstract, keywords (Election Design and Concurrent Election). The articles sought are sourced from journal articles, conference papers, and books. (3) Verification of document data through the RIS file type. The applications used for mapping are the NVIVO 12 Plus and VOSviewer software. The results of the application visualization can be used for in-depth analysis related to the research theme of election governance and concurrent elections.
3 LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 MAPPING OF RESEARCH THEMES AND DISCUSSION OF ELECTION MANAGEMENT GOVERNANCE

Numerous technical activities make up electoral governance as rule application, and the effectiveness of these activities' planning and execution determines the legitimacy of elections (Mozaffar & Schedler, 2002). A fundamentally decent practice for all EMB activities is transparency. It can help an EMB challenge perceptions, uncover genuine financial or electoral fraud, demonstrate incompetence or show preference for certain political ideologies, and it can increase the legitimacy of an EMB (Pippa Norris, 2011).

Table 1. Top 10 Documents based on Number of Citations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Dokument Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electoral management and the organisational determinants of electoral integrity: Introduction</td>
<td>TS James, HA Ganett, CV Ham</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>International Political Science Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Between governance-driven democratisation and democracy-driven governance: Explaining changes in participatory governance in the case of Barcelona</td>
<td>A, Bua, S Bussu</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2021</td>
<td>European Journal of Political Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluating electoral management body capacity</td>
<td>HA Garnett</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>International Political Science Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Duelling networks: relational clientelism in electoral-authoritarian Malaysia</td>
<td>ML Weeis</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>Democratization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Delivering electoral integrity under pressure: local government, electoral administration, and the 2016 Brexit referendum</td>
<td>TS James, A Clark</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>Local Government Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electoral Violence in Nigeria: Disentangling the Causes</td>
<td>IM Yusuf</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>Research on Humanities and Social Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Competing not complementing: KPU, Bawaslu, and the dynamic of election monitoring in PEMILU 2019</td>
<td>M, Febriansyah, TS James, NM Noor</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>Asian Journal of Political Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Free, fair and credible elections in Africa: challenges facing electoral administration in Malawi</td>
<td>MK Hussein</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>Journal of Public Administration and Development Alternative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Scopus, 2022
Table 1 above shows that the documents cited the most in the 2019-2022 timeframe can form the latest research themes on election management and election governance. The high level of citation of scientific articles in Scopus journals can introduce high recognition of new findings that can contribute internationally and locally in Indonesia. The findings of James’ election management research (2019) show that regional demographic characteristics and resource management practices can affect the performance of election administrators (James & Clark, 2021). Meanwhile Bua and Bussu state that participation and election governance are based on planning and evaluation management (Bua & Bussu, 2021). According to Jonhson (2019), the voting model on blockchains can serve as a dialogue platform for increased political participation, public discussion, and democratic contestation that upholds constitutional values and eliminates both current and potential threats (Johnson, 2019) as well as evaluation of election organizers (Garnett, 2019). Clintelism practices, social networks, and human resource discretion can affect the results and governance of elections (Lewis, 2020).

In order to compare the competence of the ten electoral management bodies (EMBs) in East and Southeast Asia to respond to digital disruptions, this paper proposes an electoral management digital readiness (EMDR) index. The objective is to evaluate the newly passed legislation and those that have amended, and to provide a composite index based on four important factors: (1) the electoral management model used; (2) the existence of new or specific laws governing digital marketing and disinformation; (3) the perception of the rule of law; and (4) the professional qualification with which the digital elections is technologically advanced. Based on this survey, the EMBs in Singapore, South Korea, Japan, Taiwan, and Thailand are highly digitally ready, compared to a medium level for Malaysia, the Philippines, and Indonesia, and a poor level for Cambodia and Myanmar (Tan, 2020).
Figure 2 shows several governance research issue topics into 7 clusters. The first to fifth clusters are a lot of publication documents. While the fifth to seventh clusters are research themes that have not been carried out by many researchers. First cluster consists of electoral politics, political accountability, political actors, political communication, political competition, political competition experience, political institutions, political outcomes, political participation, political processes, political information. The first cluster is research issues have been carried out by many researchers in the world. The second cluster is the theme of the process including issues regarding electoral processes and legal processes. The third cluster is about institutional including studies of democratic institutions, institutional choice, institutional design, and institutional framework. The fourth cluster is a system including studies on democratic election systems, election management systems, and electoral systems. The fifth cluster is voters including...
democratic voting, updating voter data, voter education, voter information, voter management, and voting process. The sixth cluster is management including election management autonomy, electoral management bodies, and electoral management design. The seventh cluster is election including the election process and organizing elections. The research theme that is still very rarely carried out is in accordance with Figure 2 below:

Figure 3. Issues for Future Research and Gap in Elections Governance Research

Source: NVIVO 12 Plus Analysis, 2022

Figure 3 shows that the research theme regarding the electoral process and organizing elections is a theme in the field of electoral research which is still very minimally carried out by researchers in the world. This data analysis is processed from 100 Scopus articles with the theme of election governance.
VOSViewer analysis through data analysis of 100 articles from Google Scholar with the keywords election governance in the world of the Network in Figure 7 shows that election design is related to issues of electoral events, participatory governance, electoral factors, electoral incentives and effective governance. The data analysis above can help researchers to examine the latest relevant topics.

4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS
4.1 MAPPING OF MODEL MANAGEMENT ELECTIONS ISSUES

The issue of concurrent elections is still one of the issues that is relevant and is of concern to democracy observers today. The issue of democracy development needs to be mapped on the evolution of the theory of election governance that has been carried out for which the research findings can provide a roadmap for future research. Analysis of the NVIVO 12 plus matrix coding found several concepts that are often used by electoral researchers globally below:
Based on Figure 5, it shows that the issues that receive the most discussion in documents published in Scopus data are electoral management design issues and electoral management bodies at 42.00%, while elections management autonomy at 28.00%. The issue that becomes an interesting theme is the collaboration of international NGOs as actors in election governance (Nikola Grishin, 2006). The 2017 elections in Yogyakarta City were conducted with integrity, with the pre-election, election, and post-election processes all adhering to the norms of electoral integrity (Sarofah et al., n.d.). A democracy in which the people actually make decisions in addition to official electoral approval (Matlosa, 2002).
Figure 6. Institutional Election Issues based on NVIVO 12 Plus Analysis Results and Issues on Institutional Elections

![Diagram showing institutional election issues based on NVIVO 12 Plus analysis results and issues on institutional elections.](image)

Source: NVIVO 12 Plus Analysis, 2022

Figure 6 on the issue of institutional elections above illustrates some of the study themes that are most widely available in Scopus publication documents, namely institutional design at 75.00%, research themes on democratic institutions at 66.00%, while research themes on institutional choice at 25.00%. This data analysis was carried out by coding references from 200 published articles sourced from the Scopus database to find some of the latest research themes. These themes can serve as guidelines for conducting relevant and up-to-date research. There are several articles which illustrate the need for re-institutional election institutions. One of which is from Hilman (2021).

This article makes the argument that the analytical focus on the administrative capacity of Indonesia's elections commissions overlooks more significant institutional factors for the declining quality of electoral governance in Indonesia. Commissions have been overwhelmed by the scale and complexity of organizing elections in a country that has the second largest number of registered voters in the world (Hillman, 2011). Transparency is frequently regarded as one of the fundamental principles that should be upheld by electoral management bodies (EMBs), where officials lay out their objectives, responsibilities, and limitations. They also provide information about citizens' rights and voting procedures, engage with stakeholders frequently, and provide justifications for
their decisions and rulings (Pippa Norris, 2011). Initiating an inquiry, the Electoral Commission gathered data from the police and numerous stakeholders, and the report sent to parliament suggested several improvements (Pippa Norris, 2011).

4.2 MAPPING OF ELECTORAL PROCESSES ISSUES

The process of holding elections in Indonesia and at the global level according to Scopus publication documents raises some of the most relevant research themes and has become the focus of research, namely legal processes by 14.00% and electoral processes by 42.00%. The most discussed research theme based on data analysis from NVIVO 12 Plus analyzing 300 Scopus and Google Scholar publication documents.

Figure 7. Election Process Issues based on NVIVO 12 Plus Analysis Results and Issues on Electoral Processes

![Bar chart showing the percentage of research on legal processes and electoral processes](chart.png)

Source: NVIVO 12 Plus Analysis, 2022

Figure 7 provides an illustration of the most interesting future research themes for conducting studies on issues of legal processes, electoral processes, electoral systems, democratic election systems, election management systems, democratic voting, and voter management. Each of these themes is very relevant for researchers in the field of social sciences to conduct future studies. As for some previous research on the electoral process, one of them is from Braun and Tausendpfund whose discoveries help comprehend the multi-level democracy better (Braun & Tausendpfund, 2020). Besides, Jereoma
suggested that the National Electoral Commission be independent and should employ its own legal counsel to supervise election-related legal issues, including the inclusion of electoral offenses as felonies under the various state laws (Jereoma, 2022). Election fraud in Africa would be eliminated by e-campaigns, e-elections, and e-voting, as well as by the composite notion of e-democracy. In general, e-governance and other associated e-public services enhance the effectiveness of government (Ajayi, 2014).

Moreover, article from Eyebe tries to analyze the correlation between democratization and electoral governance in francophone Africa from a constructivist viewpoint. It demonstrates that there is no institutional connection, even though democracy is seen as a weapon of political civilization in francophone Africa. It implies that elections are essential to regulating democracy and ensuring its legitimacy (Eyebe, 2022).

4.3 MAPPING OF ELECTORAL POLITICS ISSUES

In the data analysis section on the theme of politics, there are studies conducted by many researchers in Indonesia and the world. Based on data analysis, NVIVO Plus and VOSviewer, it is found that the research themes that were mostly carried out were electoral politics, political accountability, political actors, political communication, and political competition. However, the themes that still have gaps and can be further developed are research themes regarding political competition experience, political institutions, political outcomes, political participation, political processes, and political information. Mapping themes is very important to provide an overview of studies that have been done by national and global researchers as well as future research to provide research recommendations, to find the evolution of electoral governance theory, and even to offer the latest election models. The research themes in the field of electoral politics are shown in Figure 8 below:
Based on Figure 8 above, the theme of politics is divided into two clusters which are (1) electoral politics cluster divided into issues of political actors, political competition experience, and political transformation, and (2) political cluster about political institutions, political accountability, political outcomes, and political processes. The themes described here are research themes that can be developed by future researchers. However, based on the NVIVO 12 Plus analysis, it was found that many research themes had not been carried out by researchers globally and nationally.

In the final part of this article, we will describe the themes that are most widely discussed and have relevance based on the Scopus and Google Scholar databases, as follows:
Figure 9 is a Grob Query analysis of the issue of election governance research through the NVIVO 12 Plus application. The results of the grob query analysis provide an illustration that research themes are rarely carried out and can be developed to find research recommendations, the evolution of electoral governance theory, and even find new models. Research issues that are still very relevant and interesting for further study are election management, electoral management design, electoral management bodies, autonomous election management, institutional framework, institutional design, institutional choice, and election process. This research theme can be further developed for researchers in the field of social sciences and observers of democracy in Indonesia and globally.

5 CONCLUSION

This literature review is discussed the analysis of concurrent election governance in Indonesia by seeking primary document or sources from the most recent research globally. The research found 300 publication documents sourced from the Scopus and the Google Scholar database discussing the election process and holding elections in the
world and globally. The results of data analysis through NVIVO 12 Plus are still very rare for researchers to find article documents on Scopus regarding concurrent elections in Indonesia and globally. However, there are several study themes that can help future researchers to develop election models in accordance with the latest and relevant research. Several related research themes are: (1) Electoral politics, political accountability, political actors, political communication, political competition, political competition experience, political institutions, political outcomes, political participation, political processes, and political information. (2) Electoral process and legal process. (3) Democratic institutions, institutional choice, institutional design, and institutional framework. (4) Democratic election systems, election management systems, and electoral systems. (5) Democratic voting, updating voter data, voter education, voter information, voter management, and voting process. (6) Management, election management autonomy, electoral management bodies, and electoral management design. (7) Election which includes the election process and organizing elections. The concept of concurrent elections to be held in 2024 in Indonesia is a recent and interesting issue for further research. The results of this research can help researchers to develop future research studies and to carry out the evolution of concurrent election theory.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Our gratitude goes to Pattimura University for providing the research team with the opportunity to obtain the Institutional Research Grant of the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences. Thanks are also addressed to the lecturers of the Department of Administrative Sciences who have provided input and support so that this research can be carried out to completion.
REFERENCES


Pippa Norris. (2011). “Everyone shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any ot. 1, 1–34.

processo de "judiciarização" tem se firmado, historicamente, como uma característica da sociedade c. 1–16. https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss/article/view/31

http://www.albacharia.ma/xmlui/bitstream/handle/123456789/30506/0247Electoral management bodies as Institutions of Governance.pdf?sequence=1


